ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6191

Title: Meta-analysis of risk of interferon-associated retinopathy in diabetic and hypertensive hepatitis C patients

Reviewer code: 00052876

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 08:56

Date reviewed: 2013-10-26 04:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors did not mention in the methodology section if they needed to contact other authors for queries regarding insufficient data.   L176-178: Three [11, 18, 19], one [22], two [20, 21], one [25] and one [18] studies (study) were conducted in Japan, Egypt, USA, Canada and France, respectively. According to table 1: study [18] is a Korean one. L180-182: Patients in one [19] study were followed for 24 weeks, while the patients of other studies [11, 18, 20-22, 24, 25] had a longer follow-up. Authors must mention how they calculated the duration of follow up either from start of IFN therapy or that of retinopathy. L193, L216: Can the authors add the total number of cases in all studies used regarding HTN and IAR and DM and IAR? L332: Remove the initials in: Takase B et al [34] and Nagaoka T et al [26] reported that flow-mediated vasodilation.   Tables L: 570 the No. of cases/ controls. Mention if they are HCV or retinopathy cases and if HCV negative or retinopathy negative controls.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6191
Title: Meta-analysis of risk of interferon-associated retinopathy in diabetic and hypertensive hepatitis C patients
Reviewer code: 02521807
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 08:56
Date reviewed: 2013-12-17 04:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[Y] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Xue et al. have studied the association of HTN and/or DM and IAR risk among CHC patients by a meta-analysis strategy. Several concerns were observed by this reviewer. 1. Numerous English language mistakes are included throughout the manuscript. This point impacts on the clarity and quality of the manuscript. In order to make the manuscript intelligible, it should be revised extensively. 2. The abbreviations used throughout the text need to be clarified previous to be used, otherwise it is confussed. 3. In all cases, the authors referred as "incidence" of retinopathy. They should explain whether they discarded preexisting retinopathy at baseline. 4. Please explain the rationale to analyze differences between different interferon-alpha as well as against peg-interferon. 5. The authors should check the number of references because there are several numbers that did not correlate with the citation on text. 6. The authors should clarify the methodology to estimate the time of follow-up: have they considered the retinopathy diagnosis or, alternatively the HCV-therapy commencement? 7. The authors mentioned that "…Patients in one study were followed for 24 weeks, while the patients of other studies had a longer follow-up (line 180)". Please define the mean time (±SD) among these cited studies. 8. During the study design the authors should include the controls considered among different studies. Were included HCV chronic infected patients without retinopathy included? What about patients with retinopathy without HCV infection?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6191

Title: Meta-analysis of risk of interferon-associated retinopathy in diabetic and hypertensive hepatitis C patients

Reviewer code: 02860895

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 08:56

Date reviewed: 2013-12-22 15:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a systematic review with meta-analysis dealing with interferon-associated retinopathy (IAR). The authors studied with firm methodology, and the results are reliable. However, the most primitive matter is that IAR is basically benign and its clinical significance is not so big. The authors emphasize roles of hypertension (HT) and diabetes mellitus (DM) in the development of IAR. HT and DM themselves can be etiologies of retinopathy. I wonder whether interferon is truly harmful (whether interferon is an additional etiology of retinopathy) in HT or DM patients. To clarify a contribution of interferon to the development of retinopathy, a comparison with HT/DM patients who have not received interferon therapy is necessary.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6191
Title: Meta-analysis of risk of interferon-associated retinopathy in diabetic and hypertensive hepatitis C patients
Reviewer code: 02861124
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 08:56
Date reviewed: 2013-12-22 16:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments   1.Though a very good study,inclusion of some more sample papers on the subject would improve the data.   2.Please be consistent in defining the abbreviations and the expanded form. Define them at first place, and then use the abbreviations later. 3. Please rephrase the long sentences in to small ones to avoid ambiguity. 4. Please mind the mixing of past and present tenses in a sentence.   5. Be consistent in citing authors (references) in the text. For example 'Xue et. al.' not 'Xue J et al'. 6. There should be spaces between paragraphs of the 'Discussion' section.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6191
Title: Meta-analysis of risk of interferon-associated retinopathy in diabetic and hypertensive hepatitis C patients
Reviewer code: 02860993
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 08:56
Date reviewed: 2013-12-28 19:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of	[ ] No records	
[Y] Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The meta-analysis aimed to assess the association of HTN and/or DM and interferon-associated retinopathy risk among chronic hepatitis C patients. They surveyed the relevant papers regarding to this issue online and selected appropriate papers for meta-analysis by stringent criteria. It will be helpful to decide whether an ophthalmologic screening should be recommended for chronic hepatitis C patients with HTN or DM before, during, and after treatment. Although antiviral therapy is recommended for patients with chronic hepatitis C infection, the severe side effects are still the barriers for patients who are candidate for therapy or who are receiving therapy. The meta-analysis is interesting and the issue is important. The authors found that the patients with hypertension are at higher risk for developing retinopathy when receiving IFN-based therapy for hepatitis C infection. The major comments of this article are below: 1) The prevalent HCV genotype are different in different countries. In addition, patients with different HCV genotype may receive different duration of antiviral therapy. The authors should do the meta-analysis by stratifying various HCV genotypes. Following this issue, it will be interesting to assess whether HCV genotype may have impacts on the IFN-associated retinopathy. 2) The diabetes and hypertension are chronic diseases. Patients with these diseases should take medicines regularly to control for their blood sugar and blood pressures. Thus the compliance of taking DM or hypertensive medicines was a major concern for assessing the risk of retinopathy. Although it was a meta-analysis, the information might not be available in all the papers the authors selected, it should be discussed. 3) In table one, the time of follow-up in the eight studies were different. Did it reflect the treatment regimen was various in different studies? Will the various treatment duration be associated with the incident of retinopathy?

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6191
Title: Meta-analysis of risk of interferon-associated retinopathy in diabetic and hypertensive hepatitis C patients
Reviewer code: 02861016
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 08:56
Date reviewed: 2013-12-31 21:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[Y] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to authors: In this study, Xue et al address that Meta-analysis of risk of interferon-associated retinopathy in diabetic and hypertensive hepatitis C patients. Interferon alpha (IFN α) is widely used for the treatment of chronic hepatitis C. Ophthalmologic side effects have been reported due to the use of IFN. In this meta-analysis, hypertensive patients are at higher risk for developing retinopathy when receiving IFN-based therapy for CHC infection but not DM. This study was the first meta-analysis of relevant studies to examine retinopathy in hypertensive patients. COMMENTS Although the study is of potential interest and is well-written, there is a little space for improvement. In particular, as presented the study looks too descriptive in nature with little mechanistic insights for the observations made. 1. The title is Meta-analysis of risk of interferon-associated retinopathy in diabetic and hypertensive hepatitis C patients. The authors should discuss more details to the mechanisms between HTN and IAR, although the authors provided some data with the impaired vascular function in the retinal microcirculation. 2. Do you have discussions for different antihypertensive drugs between HTN and IAR? 3. There is minor language polishing.