

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8326

Title: ??DNA methylation of microRNA genes as diagnostic and prognostic biomarkers in HCC

Reviewer code: 00068252

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-26 10:15

Date reviewed: 2013-12-29 15:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

DNA methylation and microRNA are epigenetic mechanisms that are widely altered in human liver cancer. DNA methylation and microRNA patterns are regulated in developmental stage specific-, cell type specific- and tissue-specific manner. Although they can potentially serve as biomarkers for specific detection as well as for prognosis, monitoring and predicting therapeutic responses in HCC, it need more work to confirmed in future.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8326

Title: ??DNA methylation of microRNA genes as diagnostic and prognostic biomarkers in HCC

Reviewer code: 00069630

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-26 10:15

Date reviewed: 2014-01-08 08:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, Dr. Sumadi Lukman Anwar and Dr. Ulrich Lehmann presented a very comprehensive review on the aberrant epigenetic alteration in hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC); in particularly, they addressed the carcinogenic mechanisms and clinical implications of abnormal DNA methylation, microRNA dysregulation and the crosstalk between both of them in HCC. The manuscript was well organized and written in a clear way. Here are a few suggestions aiming to improve it further. Major point 1: The title of this paper emphasizes the “methylation of microRNA genes” in HCC, while the main content gives approximately equal attention to these three topics: methylation of genes, expression of microRNA, as well as the methylation of microRNA. Considering the promoter methylation of tumor suppressor genes in cancer has been attractive for several years, correspondingly the relevant parts in the manuscript could be more concise. Otherwise the title should be modified to cover these topics addressed thoroughly in the manuscript. Major point 2: Similar to the concept of “CIMP”, whether a certain panel of microRNA methylation could define a special subtype of HCC, further serve as a novel biomarker for diagnosis or prognosis, still depends on several issues in basic research and clinic practice. Are these methylation events the reasons for carcinogenesis, or just concomitant phenomena? How those studies attempting apply the methylation of microRNA in clinic be conducted (in retrospective, perspective or multiple-center control ways?) and how we evaluate these results? Compared with the traditional diagnostic tools or diagram, can these new biomarkers make difference in the current status of HCC therapy? Maybe these questions are difficult to give round answers, but the readers would like to share the authors’ opinions on these critical issues. Minor points 1: In the “Core tip” part, the authors mentioned “A systematic review of literatures revealed that...” Since the “systematic review” is a special article type



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

in evidence-based medicine, the term used here might lead into the misunderstanding that the following described conclusions were drew by author's analysis or cited from other publications. Minor points 2: The list of reference could be shorter, if possible.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8326

Title: ??DNA methylation of microRNA genes as diagnostic and prognostic biomarkers in HCC

Reviewer code: 00253956

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-26 10:15

Date reviewed: 2014-01-14 22:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article "DNA methylation of microRNA genes as diagnostic and prognostic biomarkers in HCC" by Anwar & Lehmann 2014, is a review of the literature detailing the involvement and potential exploitation of microRNA analyses for the benefit of diagnosis and predictive outcome in HCC. This is an exciting and emerging field of research and I am confident that many scientists will benefit from such a suitable review article. The review is comprehensive and informative, and would be able to be digested by both experts and non-experts in HCC. This review will provide a useful source of reference of work in this field. Aside from a few typographical errors that will need to be amended, I would recommend publication of the review without further revision to the content.