ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6644

Title: Association between obese-related adipokines and colorectal cancer in Korea: A case-control study, and meta-analysis for adiponectin and leptin

Reviewer code: 00227350

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-27 11:39

Date reviewed: 2013-12-05 12:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of	[ ] No records	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[Y] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good study and authors must modify some of the statements in the abstract   For Example one of the statements like: no association of adiponectin and CRC and the meta-analysis results showed a significant inverse association between adiponectin and CRC.   Materials and Methods Modify the first abatement as shown below: Blood samples were collected from the patients and the healthy individuals.   Separated serum from the blood samples werestored at -20oC for the further analysis.   Modify as shown Serum levels of adiponectin were determined by Enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA) (AdipoMark, Korea) as per the manufacturers instructions with a sensitivity of 1.39 ng/ml, and an intra-assay coefficient of variation of 4.1-5.9%. ELISA (Enzo Life Science, USA) was used to measure leptin with a sensitivity of 23.4 pg/ml, and an intra-assay coefficient of variation of 4.4-13.4%. Resistin levels were measured using resistin (human) ELISA kit (Adipogen, Switzerland) with a sensitivity of 100 pg/ml, and an intra-assay coefficient of variation 2.86-3.73%. Delete the last sentence   Mention about the cut of age range Also mention the inclusion and exclusion criteria   Did ethical approval was taken to conduct this study. If yes give the details.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6644
Title: Association between obese-related adipokines and colorectal cancer in Korea: A case-control study, and meta-analysis for adiponectin and leptin
Reviewer code: 02438889
Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan
Date sent for review: 2013-10-27 11:39
Date reviewed: 2013-12-08 18:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The text is written quite rocky and rough and needs to be improved quite a bit. How did the authors exclude CRC in the controls? What did they use for serological testing for CRC ? The p-values are missing in table 2 for resistin. In the statistical analysis I think the t-test should be used for the continious variables and the x-test for categorical variables. In the figures of the meta-analysis the p-values are not included. In the discussion please stress that the results do not show a causal relationship of the associations.