Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6210
Title: The role of regulatory T cells in the development of hepatocellular carcinoma: a systematic review and meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 02445140
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 22:20
Date reviewed: 2013-10-17 15:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[Y] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
The authors analyze the role of regulatory T cells in the development of hepatocellular carcinoma through a systematic review and meta-analysis, showing that both the circulating and the tissue populations of Tregs are higher among HCC patients. Major Compulsory Revisions -The topic is very interesting and the report is quite well written. However only manuscripts written in English should be included, being impossible for the reviewer to verify the reliability of papers written in other languages. Minor Revisions -The manuscript needs to be deeply reviewed by an English native speaker.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6210
Title: The role of regulatory T cells in the development of hepatocellular carcinoma: a systematic review and meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 02861333
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 22:20
Date reviewed: 2013-12-28 21:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
This study systematic review the publications about Treg in HCC patients. The results showed an obvious association between Tregs and HCC. The manuscript need be revised. 1. In the abstract, both the circulating and the tissue populations of Tregs among HCC patients was found to be higher than healthy controls, but there are three OR. Which OR refer to circulating and the tissue populations of Tregs? 2. Recent studies have showed Regulatory T cells display heterogeneous functions. Although the population is the same, the functions could be different. So, briefly discuss the related progression in the discussion section. 3. Redundant introduction. Please refine. 4. Thoroughly rewrite the manuscript by a native English. 5. Explain the reason for the cutoff value of 5cm for tumor size and 20 ng/ml for AFP. 6. What about the survival in high Treg patients or tumor tissue compared with low Treg patients or tumor tissue. This is more important than the comparison between HCC patients and healthy volunteers.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6210
Title: The role of regulatory T cells in the development of hepatocellular carcinoma: a systematic review and meta-analysis
Reviewer code: 02861148
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-10-09 22:20
Date reviewed: 2014-01-09 00:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[Y] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
In this review and meta-analysis the authors aimed to investigate the role of regulatory T cells (Tregs) in hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) and suggest an association between Tregs and the pathogenesis of HCC. Major: The fact that the frequency of circulating Tregs and Tregs in the HCC tumor tissue was increased in HCC patients compared to healthy controls respectively the non-tumoral liver tissue does not necessarily mean that Tregs play a significant role in the pathogenesis of HCC. Does an overexpression of Tregs correlate with time to progression, overall survival, or more aggressive tumor characteristics (e.g. metastasis, vascular invasion, higher tumor grading etc.)? The manuscript lacks a detailed discussion. The authors only superficially discuss the role of Tregs (in HCC) and their potential role in the development/progression of HCC. I am also missing a critical review of the current status and implications for future studies/research. Minor: There are spelling, grammar and typing errors throughout the whole manuscript. I suggest to consult a native speaker.