



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6097

Title: A Case of Confusing Confusion

Reviewer code: 00068211

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-02 20:06

Date reviewed: 2013-10-06 16:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Confusing Confusion is not very new, This case has different from others. We suggest :1, highlight the different. 2, discuss the different. 3, Increasing evidence of the case.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6097

Title: A Case of Confusing Confusion

Reviewer code: 00057645

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-02 20:06

Date reviewed: 2013-10-22 00:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript describes an interesting clinical case of hyperammonemia secondary to spleno-renal shunt in a patient with previous gastric by-pass for obesity. There are several concerns and major issues that should be addressed by the Authors before a possible publication: - Even if it is a clinical case it would be preferable to have a brief introduction to the case report with a clarification of the aims of the manuscript (i.e the unusual complication of obesity surgery or the details of the percutaneous treatment of spleno-renal shunts). The clarification of the aim can help the Editor to address the paper to WJG or an interventional radiology journal; - It seems that there is a correlation between by pass surgery and spleno-renal shunt, the Authors should clarify the type of surgery and the occurrence of any intra- or post-operative complications (at the Rx exams in figure 1 there are many clips near the vessels). - In the preoperative CT scan any vascular reconstruction of spleno-portal-mesenteric axis was performed in order to identify any occlusion or stenosis of the portal vein? - Is an upper GI endoscopy performed to identify any sign of portal hypertension with varices? - During angiographic procedure was the portal pressure measured? - What was the reason why the Authors proceeded to the closure of the splenic vein instead of the spleno-renal shunt?