

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6377

Title: Dynamic slopes of changes in circulating Foxp3+ regulatory T cells and interleukin-17 producing T helper cells along HBV related acute-on-chronic liver failure(ACHBLF) event

Reviewer code: 00460370

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-16 14:11

Date reviewed: 2013-11-21 10:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, authors aimed to longitudinally investigate the expression levels of Th17 and regulatory T (Treg) cells in patients with HBV-related acute-on-chronic liver failure (ACHBLF) and analyze the potential change patterns between Th17 and Treg during the follow-up period. Major comments 1.The data are overall interesting. Although the numbers of patients are small, they are well characterized. However, the absence of mechanistic data was observed in this manuscript. 2.The histology and immunohistochemistry study would be helpful to elucidate the pathogenic role of Th17 and Treg cells-related cytokines. It would be interesting to investigate the expression levels of these cytokines in liver biopsy specimens from patients with HBV-related acute-on-chronic liver failure (ACHBLF). 3.The potential effect of anti-viral medications including hepatoprotective and antiviral drugs on the expression levels of Th17 and Treg cells is important. This issue should be presented and discussed. 4.How were the cut-off values defined for the FACS staining experiments? 5.The authors try to illustrate the opinion that Th17 cells are main cellular sources of IL-17 in ACHBLF patients. But a recently paper provided the evidence that only a small proportion of cellular sources of IL-17 in human were T cells, and the majority of IL-17A expressions were mast cells. Authors would give some explanations in the section of "Discussion". 6.In the section of "Materials and Methods", PBMCs were isolated from heparinized peripheral blood of the studied subjects by standard Ficoll-paque density centrifugation, "mRNA" was extracted...., the word of "mRNA" should be revised to "total RNA".

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6377

Title: Dynamic slopes of changes in circulating Foxp3+ regulatory T cells and interleukin-17 producing T helper cells along HBV related acute-on-chronic liver failure(ACHBLF) event

Reviewer code: 02462700

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-16 14:11

Date reviewed: 2013-12-01 22:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good study on the immunity of ACHBLF. However, there are some minor problems in the article. 1.The authors should not put their conclusions in the section of INTRODUCTION (last paragraph in introduction). 2.The authors concluded that "Dynamic increased Treg/Th17 ratio was associated with the survival of ACHBLF patients". It is not very reasonable, because the sample is too small (18 patients) in the study. 3.The language should be carefully revised.