

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9252

Title: Autologous bone marrow mononuclear cell transplantation improves liver function and reduces disease complications in decompensated liver cirrhosis patients

Reviewer code: 00742516

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2014-02-08 10:11

Date reviewed: 2014-02-16 11:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors, The article presents a significant and valuable clinical research describing the efficacy of BM-MNCs transplantation on improving liver function and reducing the complications in decompensated cirrhosis patients. **QUERIES:** 1.it is not clear how the patients were managed? 2.it is not clear what were the patients survival situation? **SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:** Line 35, please elaborate on the "43 out of t47"

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9252

Title: Autologous bone marrow mononuclear cell transplantation improves liver function and reduces disease complications in decompensated liver cirrhosis patients

Reviewer code: 00140083

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2014-02-08 10:11

Date reviewed: 2014-02-23 17:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

MAJOR CRITICISMS: 1. The comparison of 32 vs 15 patients cannot lead to definitive conclusions. 2. The Authors should indicate how many cells were transfused into the patients. 3. Lines 274-278, page 11: "In conclusion, infusion of autologous BM-MNCs is safe and effective in patients with decompensated cirrhosis for at least 12 months. The approach significantly improves patient's liver function, blood coagulation and short-term quality of life, it also reduces the incidence of serious complications, and can be considered as a suitable regenerative therapy in decompensated cirrhosis". The data presented do not justify the conclusion that should be much more balanced and careful. 4. Lines 105-107, page 4: "In the treatment group, 32 patients were treated with BM-MNCs plus conventional internal medicine regimen including drugs for anti-HBV virus, liver cell protection, transaminase and jaundice reducing drugs". Please indicate the names of all the drugs used. 5. A picture of the BM-MNCs infused should be included. 6. English needs major revision throughout the manuscript. E.g., Line 39, page 2: "The efficacy was monitored during the follow-up of 24 months for 24 months"; Line 60, page 3: "The patient presented with" must be replaced by "presenting with"; Line 62, page 3: "decompensation" must be replaced by "decompensated"; Line 64, page 3: "Orthotropic" must be replaced by "Orthotopic". **MINOR CRITICISMS:** 1. Line 47, page 2: "BM-MNCs transplantation is safe and effective" should be replaced by "seems to be safe and effective". 2. Lines 94-96, page 4: "Therefore, repeated transplantation of autologous BM-MNCs might represent a routine therapeutic approach to improve the general conditions of decompensated cirrhosis patients" should be replaced by "perhaps in the future repeated transplantation of



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com <http://www.wjgnet.com>

autologous BM-MNCs at regular time intervals might be used to improve the outcome of decompensated cirrhotic patients". 3. Lines 227-228, page 10: "In our study, we use a slightly different approach, namely using the BM-MNCs infusion as a regular treatment regimen plus other medication". What does "regular treatment regimen" means? It does not seem that the treatment was given at regular intervals but rather once.

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9252**Title:** Autologous bone marrow mononuclear cell transplantation improves liver function and reduces disease complications in decompensated liver cirrhosis patients**Reviewer code:** 00069262**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-08 10:11**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-26 08:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper entitled "Autologous bone marrow mononuclear cell transplantation improves liver function and reduces disease complications in decompensated liver cirrhosis patients" is a good clinical work, I suggest dividing Tables 1, 3 and 4 as they are very informative.