



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9252

**Title:** Autologous bone marrow mononuclear cell transplantation improves liver function and reduces disease complications in decompensated liver cirrhosis patients

**Reviewer code:** 00742516

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-08 10:11

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-16 11:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors, The article presents a significant and valuable clinical research describing the efficacy of BM-MNCs transplantation on improving liver function and reducing the complications in decompensated cirrhosis patients. **QUERIES:** 1.it is not clear how the patients were managed? 2.it is not clear what were the patients survival situation? **SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:** Line 35, please elaborate on the "43 out of t47"



**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9252

**Title:** Autologous bone marrow mononuclear cell transplantation improves liver function and reduces disease complications in decompensated liver cirrhosis patients

**Reviewer code:** 00140083

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-08 10:11

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-23 17:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

**MAJOR CRITICISMS:** 1. The comparison of 32 vs 15 patients cannot lead to definitive conclusions. 2. The Authors should indicate how many cells were transfused into the patients. 3. Lines 274-278, page 11: "In conclusion, infusion of autologous BM-MNCs is safe and effective in patients with decompensated cirrhosis for at least 12 months. The approach significantly improves patient's liver function, blood coagulation and short-term quality of life, it also reduces the incidence of serious complications, and can be considered as a suitable regenerative therapy in decompensated cirrhosis". The data presented do not justify the conclusion that should be much more balanced and careful. 4. Lines 105-107, page 4: "In the treatment group, 32 patients were treated with BM-MNCs plus conventional internal medicine regimen including drugs for anti-HBV virus, liver cell protection, transaminase and jaundice reducing drugs". Please indicate the names of all the drugs used. 5. A picture of the BM-MNCs infused should be included. 6. English needs major revision throughout the manuscript. E.g., Line 39, page 2: "The efficacy was monitored during the follow-up of 24 months for 24 months"; Line 60, page 3: "The patient presented with" must be replaced by "presenting with"; Line 62, page 3: "decompensation" must be replaced by "decompensated"; Line 64, page 3: "Orthotropic" must be replaced by "Orthotopic".

**MINOR CRITICISMS:** 1. Line 47, page 2: "BM-MNCs transplantation is safe and effective" should be replaced by "seems to be safe and effective". 2. Lines 94-96, page 4: "Therefore, repeated transplantation of autologous BM-MNCs might represent a routine therapeutic approach to improve the general conditions of decompensated cirrhosis patients" should be replaced by "perhaps in the future repeated transplantation of



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com) <http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

autologous BM-MNCs at regular time intervals might be used to improve the outcome of decompensated cirrhotic patients". 3. Lines 227-228, page 10: "In our study, we use a slightly different approach, namely using the BM-MNCs infusion as a regular treatment regimen plus other medication". What does "regular treatment regimen" means? It does not seem that the treatment was given at regular intervals but rather once.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9252

**Title:** Autologous bone marrow mononuclear cell transplantation improves liver function and reduces disease complications in decompensated liver cirrhosis patients

**Reviewer code:** 00069262

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-08 10:11

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-26 08:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper entitled "Autologous bone marrow mononuclear cell transplantation improves liver function and reduces disease complications in decompensated liver cirrhosis patients" is a good clinical work, I suggest dividing Tables 1, 3 and 4 as they are very informative.