

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7449

Title: Two-stage treatment with hepatectomy and carbon-ion radiotherapy for multiple hepatic epithelioid hemangioendotheliomas

Reviewer code: 02454257

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-19 20:37

Date reviewed: 2013-12-13 00:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Review for manuscript number 7449 Two-stage treatment for HEH The authors focus on HEH and the necessary therapy, an interesting issue with little available literature. General remark: Twelve authors are listed for the case report regarding the treatment of one patient. Even though the contributions of the respective authors are listed it should be explained why, given the extent of the manuscript, 5 authors were required to perform data analysis; the same applies for the particle therapy. Did these 5 colleagues contribute significantly? Introduction: Regarding therapy of HEH the authors reflect too much on liver transplantation. The available alternatives like liver resection and TACE should be mentioned as well (see also Grotz TE, HPB 2010 and Wang, WJS 2012). Case report: The case report is structured clearly. For the sake of completeness it should be mentioned if the infiltrated Fascia Gerota has been resected with an oncological approach. Discussion: Most part of the available literature is reflected in the discussion part of the here presented manuscript. Taken together the discussion is focused too much on surgical procedures. In this context the authors should explain why they decided against the parenchyma saving resection of the liver tumors. For the sake of equilibrium the possibility of TACE should be mentioned. Furthermore, it should be brought up that there are patients in the spontaneous course alive after 5 years without therapy. The in detail described application of particle radiotherapy in HCC should be shortened since HCC and HEH are different entities regarding tumor biology. Altogether the discussion should be more focused and streamlined. The authors are presenting a highly interesting therapy approach which possibly does have the potential to significantly modify the therapy concept of HEH. Even if one may share the delight in the good results for the patient the euphoria in the discussion should be



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

dampened. It should not be forgotten that this is a single case. After revision this manuscript may be published in WJG.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7449

Title: Two-stage treatment with hepatectomy and carbon-ion radiotherapy for multiple hepatic epithelioid hemangioendotheliomas

Reviewer code: 02441746

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-19 20:37

Date reviewed: 2013-12-13 17:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] Existed	[] Major revision
		[] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report describes the effectiveness of carbon-ion radiotherapy for HEH and the efficacy of a novel strategy for the management of multiple bilobar hepatic tumors by combining surgery and radiotherapy.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7449

Title: Two-stage treatment with hepatectomy and carbon-ion radiotherapy for multiple hepatic epithelioid hemangioendotheliomas

Reviewer code: 00071652

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-19 20:37

Date reviewed: 2013-12-30 00:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is rare case. however it is not priority for publishing.