

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7926

Title: Mast cell deficiency exacerbates inflammatory bowel symptoms in IL-10-deficient mice

Reviewer code: 00201279

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-12-08 14:00

Date reviewed: 2013-12-13 20:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors cross-bred mast cell-deficient mice with IL-10-deficient mice to investigate the role of mast cells in gut inflammation and the onset of colitis. Data show that mast cells have protective roles in the development of colitis by suppressing Th1 type immune response and inflammation, altering gut microbiota composition, improving gut epithelial barrier function, and reducing epithelial damage. REMARKS. I suggest to show the histological pictures present in Figure 1 at higher magnification.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7926

Title: Mast cell deficiency exacerbates inflammatory bowel symptoms in IL-10-deficient mice

Reviewer code: 00069751

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-12-08 14:00

Date reviewed: 2013-12-16 21:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to the Authors ESPS Manuscript NO: 7926 The authors are describing very interesting results about the effects of mast cell deficiency on colitis in a double knockout mouse model obtained by cross-breeding mast cell-deficient mice with IL-10-deficient mice. The paper is well-written, the methods used are sound, the results are novel and are a basis for future work in this research area. I recommend to accept this paper for publication in the World Journal of Gastroenterology as it stands.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7926

Title: Mast cell deficiency exacerbates inflammatory bowel symptoms in IL-10-deficient mice

Reviewer code: 00641306

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-12-08 14:00

Date reviewed: 2013-12-20 01:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript examines colitis development in IL-10 deficient mice when crossed with mice carrying the c-kit W “sash” mutation. This is thus similar to a study published in 2010 by different authors showing that these double mutants develop enhanced colitis and intestinal permeability. This manuscript is thus confirmatory but does provide some new data. 1. There are some new data presented, but they add little to our understanding of how mast cells normally reduce severity of IBD in IL-10 deficient mice. 2. Changes in claudins 2 and 3 re reported. Claudin2 mRNA is unchanged but protein is increased. Claudin 3 mRNA is decreased but protein is not. The authors must address the discrepancies between their mRNA and protein data. 3. A change in Rhamnococcus abundance is reported, but it is unclear how this relates to the development of colitis in this model. 4. How does the high energy diet in the mothers effect these results? It is odd that control diets did not produce successful breeding. The data on glucose metabolism and body fat are not well connected to a role for mast cells in the context of IBD and may be a completely separate issue. Minor comments. The authors should not refer to double knockouts. Sash is a hypomorphic allele of Kit, not a knockout. Please be consistent in use of FFA (not FAA). Why do methods refer to fetal plasma fatty acids?? GAPDH is misspelled in table 2