

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6393

**Title:** HCV REINFECTION AFTER LIVER TRANSPLANTATION: IS THERE A ROLE FOR DIRECT ANTIVIRAL AGENTS?

**Reviewer code:** 01438560

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-16 17:15

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-17 01:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The objective of this manuscript is to review the literature to determine the effect of direct antiviral agents on patients with hepatitis C virus who underwent liver transplantation. The paper is well written, but there is a fundamental limitation to reach any conclusion. There are only few publications on the subject and all them have important scientific limitations.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6393

**Title:** HCV REINFECTION AFTER LIVER TRANSPLANTATION: IS THERE A ROLE FOR DIRECT ANTIVIRAL AGENTS?

**Reviewer code:** 02438659

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-16 17:15

**Date reviewed:** 2013-10-20 12:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The strategies to effectively treat or prevent HCV recurrence after liver transplantation (LT) remains a challenge. This paper reviews the use of a new class of potent direct-acting antiviral agents (DAAs) in LT HCV patients.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6393

**Title:** HCV REINFECTION AFTER LIVER TRANSPLANTATION: IS THERE A ROLE FOR DIRECT ANTIVIRAL AGENTS?

**Reviewer code:** 00012149

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-16 17:15

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-06 14:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The article entitled "HCV REINFECTION AFTER LIVER TRANSPLANTATION: IS THERE A ROLE FOR DIRECT ANTIVIRAL AGENTS?" by Dall'Agata et al reviewed current progress on the use of direct antiviral agents in the treating or preventing HCV reinfection in patients after liver transplantation. This is an interesting topic. However, there are several defects in this paper. 1. The article was poorly written as there are numerous mistakes of grammar, which were added in the comments. 2. The authors should search clinical trial databases, such as [www.clinicaltrials.gov/](http://www.clinicaltrials.gov/), in which they may find more related data. 3. They should include a table to describe current DAAs, which have been approved, are in clinical trials, and under development.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6393

**Title:** HCV REINFECTION AFTER LIVER TRANSPLANTATION: IS THERE A ROLE FOR DIRECT ANTIVIRAL AGENTS?

**Reviewer code:** 00742524

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-16 17:15

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-16 00:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Concerns raised in the previous round of review have been addressed. The review is timely and useful to those concerned with anti-HCV therapy after liver transplantation. New results (e.g. Werner et al., PLoS One 8:e80528, 2013; Werner et al., Z Gastroenterol 52:27-34, 2014; Coilly et al., Liver Int. Suppl 1:46-52, 2014) available in the literature should be included in a further revised version of the review.