

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9071

Title: Ulcerative colitis as a polymicrobial infection characterized by a sustained broken mucus barrier

Reviewer code: 00503405

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-19 16:15

Date reviewed: 2014-01-22 01:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the review article of Chen et al. about UC as a polymicrobial infection with defected mucus barrier the authors aimed to highlight the role of luminal bacteria in the pathogenesis of UC. The review is about a clinically very important topic, contains many new information about microbiota in UC, but the most interesting thing, namely the connection of luminal pathogens to mucosal immunity is not discussed. In this issue the role of TLRs (especially TLR5 and TLR9) as a switch point between innate and adaptive immunity must be discussed. English language needs minor polishing. After major revision I suggest to accept the article for publishing in WJG.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9071

Title: Ulcerative colitis as a polymicrobial infection characterized by a sustained broken mucus barrier

Reviewer code: 00503587

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-19 16:15

Date reviewed: 2014-01-25 05:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reviews aspects of microbiology and the mucus layer relevant to the pathogenesis of UC. Specific Comments: 1. Overall, there are a number of sections that appear quite jumbled, with poor flow. One example is the section on bacteria in UC. Reorganisation of this (and several other sections) to ensure optimal flow and coordination of ideas and concepts is required. 2. Further, the text comments on the destruction of mucus in one paragraph, but this is followed by a section detailing the nature of mucus and mucins: these are in the wrong order. Similarly, the nature of the intestinal microflora should be introduced before outlining changes in the flora that are noted in the context of UC. 3. The initial sections of the manuscript do not refer to genetics - this is only mentioned in the last page of the manuscript. This should be reviewed also. 4. The Introduction section refers to the DSS model of colitis. This is model of one aspect of colitis, and the findings should be presented with more caution. 5. Page 3 refers to a microbial module - it is not sure what this is? 6. The authors should mention in the abstract and/or Introduction that this is review article. this is not clearly apparent. 7. There are errors of English word usage and grammar that require correction. 8. The references are not all in the correct format. The page numbers are not present. 9. The authors should consider preparing a diagram or cartoon that illustrated the key features of the work - this would greatly enhance the usefulness of this review.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9071

Title: Ulcerative colitis as a polymicrobial infection characterized by a sustained broken mucus barrier

Reviewer code: 00034437

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-19 16:15

Date reviewed: 2014-02-11 12:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors demonstrated that polymicrobial infection characterized by sustained broken mucus barrier led to subsequent bacterial migration toward the mucosa and proliferation of complex bacterial biofilm on the epithelial surface in UC patients with human as well as animal models Major Overall, this paper is interesting, however, this reviewer would like the authors to add more basic research data regarding abnormality of goblet cells in patients with UC. For example, Hes-Notch signaling pathway plays an important role in the differentiation of goblet cells. Minor There are some wrong references. Please check it.