

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9187

Title: Neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio predicts the prognosis of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma after liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 01562153

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-25 10:19

Date reviewed: 2014-01-27 23:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a "Letter to the Editor" with discussions focusing on the article by Xiao et al. (Neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio predicts the prognosis of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma after liver transplantation. World J Gastroenterol 2013; 19: 8398-407). The authors addressed 3 issues that sounded reasonable. Comment The number of References could be decreased.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9187

Title: Neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio predicts the prognosis of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma after liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 02861401

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-25 10:19

Date reviewed: 2014-02-08 07:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article written by Huseyin Kayadibi et al attempts to commend on Yan's paper. Yan's paper has been published already and is well-written, although there is room to improve as suggested by Huseyin Kayadibi et al. The study in Yan's paper was well designed with clear objective, and the method and results were clearly presented. The first comment made by Huseyin was clearly presented in Yan's paper. Yan was focusing on NLR, but he had never claimed to used NLR as a single test parameter to replace total tumor size and macro-vascular invasion. My understanding that Yan did not focus on total tumor size and macro-vascular invasion is because those two factors were well reported before. The other two comments made by Huseyin in the current article are valuable for improving Yan's paper and their future research. It would be better to delieve those comments to Yan. However, this article is not substantial enough to be a stand alone artile (even if it might be just for a communication artile).

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9187

Title: Neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio predicts the prognosis of patients with hepatocellular carcinoma after liver transplantation

Reviewer code: 00537002

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-25 10:19

Date reviewed: 2014-02-10 12:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the original paper, NLR was the significant factor of tumor recurrence but the other factors were selected as prognostic factors. Because NLR is more complicated due to being a combined factor of inflammation and immune reaction, possible causes affecting NLR should be discussed in the paper. Therefore, the authors' suggestion is thought-provoking. It is suitable for publication in World Journal of Gastroenterology.