



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8501

Title: RAD51 potentiates synergistic effects of with and PCI-24781 potentiates chemotherapy cis-diamminedichloroplatinum on gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00069066

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-29 20:25

Date reviewed: 2014-01-01 09:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: the title is confusing and not clear. The evaluated drug is PCI-2481. RAD51 is reduced by the drug, why was it said contrary? Abstract: ?State the aim of study in the background. ?The method should consist of place and time the study took place. ?You said "GC cell lines were treated with PCI-24781 and/or cis-diamminedichloroplatinum". In the text, you said that the group is (1) negative control; (2) PCI-24781; (3) CDDP. Please cross-check. ?It is not well written about the in vivo study in method of abstract. Statistical analysis should be described. ?There is no numeric data in the result. Give more data in the result besides tell the discussion. How significant did it show? Introduction ?Describe the aim of the study rather than give conclusion. ?Describe the RAD51 to introduce that before you write in the discussion. ?Describe how important to combine PCI-24781 with CDDP and the background you would combine it with PCI-24781 in the study. Methods: ?Mention the protein you assayed and the gene you did the qPCR. ?Mention the place and time you did the study ?What did you do in the in vitro study? Describe it. And how do you treat the cell culture after you put in specific medium? Results ?The subheadings are too long. ?You said the clonogenicity was impaired. How many colonies? How many percent the plating efficiency? ?Do not mix result and discussion. ?"CDDP exerts its chemotherapeutic effect mainly by causing DNA damage. However, DNA damage can be repaired through homologous recombination (HR) or through non-homologous end joining (NHEJ) [23], which can lead to chemotherapy resistance. HR usually occurs during and shortly after DNA replication during the S and G2 phases of the cell cycle, when sister chromatids are more easily available [24]." → This statement is more fit in the introduction. ?The therapy was initiated after the volume 100mm³. With the observation



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

2x/week, how can you start with the exact 100 mm³? If not, show mean volume, when you start the treatment in each group? It would be better if you use the same measurement. First you showed the volume (100mm³) and at the termination of the study, you showed the weight. It would confuse the reader to compare. Discussion If possible, give more data about another study, e.g.: "Adimoolam et al. also confirmed that PCI-24781 could decrease RAD51 expression and suppress HR in colon tumor cells [38]" give the data about how much the decrease, so reader could objectively give opinion about it.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8501

Title: RAD51 potentiates synergistic effects of with and PCI-24781 potentiates chemotherapy cis-diamminedichloroplatinum on gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00077340

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-12-29 20:25

Date reviewed: 2014-01-06 22:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Weiling He et al. entitled "RAD51 potentiates synergistic effects of with and PCI-24781 potentiates chemotherapy cis-diamminedichloroplatinum on gastric cancer" reported a series of evaluation for the efficacy of PCI-24781 on gastric cancer. Though each experiment is well designed, but to be considered for publishing, the authors should consider about the below comments.

Major Comments

1. What experiment did authors use gastric epithelial cell line GES-1 for? And, please mention about the background of HGC27 and AGS, such as pathological findings and information of high or low malignancy, because these two cell lines shows similar results.
2. I have a question about the dosage of PCI-24781 and CDDP for in vivo therapeutic studies. About PCI-24781, what reliable informations does author have from the company? And then, how does author decide the concentration (10mg/kg/day) of CDDP?

Minor Comments

1. The title of this manuscript is grammatically difficult to understand. The author needs to revise it, such as "RAD51 potentiates synergistic effects of chemotherapy with PCI-24781 and cis-diamminedichloroplatinum on gastric cancer".