Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7418
Title: A simple scoring system for predicting cirrhosis in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease
Reviewer code: 02441249
Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin
Date sent for review: 2013-11-18 14:37
Date reviewed: 2013-11-24 10:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
The manuscript aimed to develop a simple noninvasive scoring system for predicting liver cirrhosis in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease patients by using early available clinical and biochemical variables. This article is interesting, original and well written, and gives good clues to the readers. The work can be published to format for Original Article.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7418
Title: A simple scoring system for predicting cirrhosis in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease
Reviewer code: 01489386
Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin
Date sent for review: 2013-11-18 14:37
Date reviewed: 2013-12-01 11:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[Y]Rejection
[Y] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read with interest the manuscript by Yoneda et al. The authors tried to find a simple way of identification of patients with cirrhosis of liver with NASH using laboratory tests. In this setting they reported that most of their cohort can be identified with presence of 2 or more of risk factors. Unfortunately this manuscript has many pitfalls that most of them were presented in the limitations section. This limitations appear to be so great that makes it very difficult to accept the results as valid. Since the cohort of the patients with cirrhosis is significantly under represented (about 4%), I assume that the majority of cirrhotics were identified with imaging studies instead and never undergone a liver biopsy. Thus the cut offs of such high values and almost close to normal range were over represented in the cohort. In a sense it is very less likely in a clinical practice to find a patient with moderate or advanced fibrosis with such close to normal values. Also we are in an age that are not devoid of multiple scoring systems that all have their limitations. I am not sure how this scoring system will compare to the others as these comparisons were not made. The generalizability is an issue too. I have to however commend the authors for the style of the manuscript and the presentation which was great.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7418
Title: A simple scoring system for predicting cirrhosis in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease
Reviewer code: 00069262
Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin
Date sent for review: 2013-11-18 14:37
Date reviewed: 2013-12-02 12:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
It's a good job, I think it is good quality for publication. The authors performed a very interesting study. Congratulations