

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10276

Title: Surgical management of colonic diverticular disease: Is there a difference in outcome between right-sided and left-sided disease?

Reviewer code: 02549250

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-03-24 08:36

Date reviewed: 2014-03-25 19:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good retrospective review of surgically treated diverticular disease in a tertiary referral hospital in Korea. The report is fairly comprehensive. A few points are worth mentioning: 1. A comparison is made to a historical series from studies in 1982 and 1990. Unfortunately an important piece of information missing is the total number of patients referred/admitted with diverticulosis to this unit. This information would be helpful in giving the complete picture. Is this information available? 2. The authors hypothesise that the poorer prognosis in the left side diverticular disease (longer post-op stay and higher complication rate) is due to a delay in diagnosis. Data on timing of the operation in each group should be included. 3. Clarification on the surgical approach to the abdomen is required (Open/Laparoscopic).



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10276

Title: Surgical management of colonic diverticular disease: Is there a difference in outcome between right-sided and left-sided disease?

Reviewer code: 00040472

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-03-24 08:36

Date reviewed: 2014-03-26 21:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study would read better if duplication of results by excess tables was avoided.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10276

Title: Surgical management of colonic diverticular disease: Is there a difference in outcome between right-sided and left-sided disease?

Reviewer code: 02727993

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-03-24 08:36

Date reviewed: 2014-04-05 01:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comment 1 Discussion: "Our study confirmed that the incidence of diverticulosis, particularly that of left-sided diverticulosis, is increasing in Korea. " This study included only patients that had been operated for diverticular disease. This conclusion is not accurate since there must have been patients that were treated conservatively. Comment 2 What type of diverticulae did your patients with right side diverticulosis and bleeding have- true or false? Comment 3 Discussion "The reasons for the poorer prognosis are hypothesized to include a delay in diagnosis due to the uncommon nature of the disease, as well as the progression of disease to a more complicated form." This hypothesis cannot be sustained based on the data presented. Additionally, it is rather strange that in a tertiary hospital the diagnosis of diverticulitis is being delayed.