

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5120

Title: EFFICACY OF NEOADJUVANT THERAPY AND SURGICAL RESCUE FOR LOCALLY ADVANCED HEPATOBLASTOMAS: 10 YEARS SINGLE-CENTER EXPERIENCE AND LITERATURE REVIEW.

Reviewer code: 02440231

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-16 13:32

Date reviewed: 2013-09-05 11:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The introduction section contains several paragraphs with little descriptions of the efficacy of neoadjuvant chemotherapy for Hbl. Moreover, the authors didn't express clearly their contribution, the problem and specially their confirmation. 2. In the "therapeutic approach to locally advanced hepatoblastoma", the authors did not show clearly why seven patients received different neoadjuvant chemotherapy. 3. According to the review of current literature (Table 2), this study has fewer cases of patients with neoadjuvant chemotherapy. How could the authors explain this? The authors should show more credibility in accordance with results.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5120

Title: EFFICACY OF NEOADJUVANT THERAPY AND SURGICAL RESCUE FOR LOCALLY ADVANCED HEPATOBLASTOMAS: 10 YEARS SINGLE-CENTER EXPERIENCE AND LITERATURE REVIEW.

Reviewer code: 02444984

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-16 13:32

Date reviewed: 2013-09-12 07:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reported an article entitled "EFFICACY OF NEOADJUVANT THERAPY AND SURGICAL RESCUE FOR LOCALLY ADVANCED HEPATOBLASTOMAS: 10 YEARS SINGLE-CENTER EXPERIENCE AND LITERATURE REVIEW." Is it a case report or a review of literature? The conjunction "AND" in the title is not indicated!!! Conclusions cannot be supported by the design of this study. Introduction section-line 5: "Most of the Hbl are asymptomatic and in advanced stage at the moment of diagnosis" How many? these assertion needs justification by reference. The aim of this study is vague "we attempt to report our excellent experience with long-term outcomes of Hbl after a multimodal management therapy and a review of current literature.". What did the authors mean by excellent experience??? "PRETEXT staging at diagnosis was as follows: Stage I 57.1% (n=4), Stage II 28.5% (n=2) and Stage III 14.4% (n=1)." there is no place for percentages. Discussion section-line6:"Our series is an excellent example of how multimodal management," it is an emotional assertion, it should be avoided.