

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5679

Title: Probiotics for the treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in children

Reviewer code: 00503623

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 20:09

Date reviewed: 2013-09-24 01:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript provides well organized review of the literature on the use of probiotics to control or eradicate Hp infection in children. The authors also provide a thoughtful discussion of the available data as to the effect of adding probiotics to the standard Hp eradication therapies. This is an informative and well presented paper which should be of considerable interest to the readership of the Journal. Good Job !

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5679

Title: Probiotics for the treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in children

Reviewer code: 02536311

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 20:09

Date reviewed: 2013-09-24 07:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting review of probiotics for the treatment of H. pylori. Please add references for the association of H. pylori with family size, clustering, low SES and education (some good papers in American Journal of Epidemiology). It is incorrect that spontaneous eradication is rare in children. Cohort studies in Mexico have established very good rates of reinfection / recrudescence. The rates are actually higher than adults, and depend on age. Please review those articles and cite them. Add a forest plot for the meta analysis and discuss it.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5679

Title: Probiotics for the treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in children

Reviewer code: 00058744

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 20:09

Date reviewed: 2013-10-01 23:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a detailed review about the relation between probiotics and H. pylori infection. The authors described about the mechanism of the effect of probiotics against H. pylori infection, and the authors performed meta-analysis about the effective rate of probiotics added on H. pylori eradication. And the results showed that probiotics added eradication therapy was effective. The numbers of references and the structure of the manuscript is good.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5679

Title: Probiotics for the treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in children

Reviewer code: 00068184

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 20:09

Date reviewed: 2013-10-03 22:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear editor Thank you for referring me this manuscript for review. I read the manuscript entitled; Probiotics for the treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in children; thoroughly. It has discussed an important issue in its field. But the manuscript is too long. Findings in the ;Utilization of probiotics in association with antibiotics in the treatment of H. pylori and Utilization of probiotics alone, sections were repeated in tables and text, that should be deleted in one of them for example ref 46 until 55 are repeated in both text and table.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5679

Title: Probiotics for the treatment of Helicobacter pylori infection in children

Reviewer code: 00074172

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-22 20:09

Date reviewed: 2013-10-06 03:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reviews the data in the pediatric population concerning use of probiotics in the eradication of H. pylori. The authors expand on both the function of probiotics in eradication as well as on the lessening of treatment associated side effects. The topic is important, as many patients seek out what are regarded as "less toxic" methods of treatment and probiotics are definitely seen as such. I think that the authors did a good job summarizing the various studies without making the document too long. They may want to edit down by a page or so. I have a few comments - 1. (clarithromycin plus amoxicillin or metronidazole) - this should be changed to "amoxicillin plus clarithromycin or metronidazole" since the amoxicillin is the base along with PPI in all recommendations. Clarithromycin use is decreasing, especially in children as resistance rates rise. (appears in the abstract and twice in the text) 2. Spontaneous clearance of HP was originally regarded as very low as stated by the authors, however there are now several studies which indicate that this is not uncommon at all. (page 3) 3. Page 12 - "Of the 132 H. pylori-positive children withdrew in the beginning because they did not like the cheese." this sentence is missing a number before the word children.