

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7477

**Title:** STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Inflammation Associated Colorectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 02567654

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-20 20:27

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-21 04:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The manuscript by Nguyen and colleagues reviews the compelling evidence for a pathogenic role of the STAT3/S1P pathway in mouse models of IBD-associated colorectal carcinogenesis. The while the discussion of authors' own work, pages 9-13, is well-planned and logical, the rest of the manuscript suffers from several structural problems: 1) The first paragraph is completely irrelevant to the rest of the review; it might be more appropriate to replace it with a brief review of primary evidence on IBD-CRC incidence/risk or discuss known genetic pathways for IBD-CRC 2) The introductory material is built on relatively little primary data. For example, 20 of the first 30 references are reviews; please cite primary studies wherever possible. 3) Material on pages 3-8 is often very awkward in flow, lacking logical (or deliberate) connections between concepts and ideas. For instance, the authors frequently move back and forth from murine to human data and move between multiple different tumor types. 4) JAK-inhibitors, especially tofacitinib, which is in phase III clinical trials for ulcerative colitis, should be reviewed as targeted therapy as well.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7477

**Title:** STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Inflammation Associated Colorectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 02530212

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-20 20:27

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-25 11:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent review article elucidating that the recent development in the research of inflammation-associated colorectal cancer and especially the potential crucial role of Stat3 and sphingosine regulated pathways and their interaction in tumorigenesis and tumor progression.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7477

**Title:** STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Inflammation Associated Colorectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 00068518

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-20 20:27

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-30 20:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The MS by the authors reviewed recently published data on the role of STAT3/S1P in IBD related-CRC. The structure of the reviews, including four sub-topics, need well organized. In the third part of the structure, STAT3 and SIP signaling in tumor progression, authors discussed their own works, more words and more specific evidences should be presented.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7477

**Title:** STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Inflammation Associated Colorectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 00058563

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-20 20:27

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-02 07:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Inflammation Associated Colorectal Cancer Andrew V. Nguyen<sup>1</sup>, Yuan-Yuan Wu<sup>2</sup> and Elaine. This article aims to review evidence of pathogenic role of the STAT3/s1P pathway in IBD associated colorectal cancer. Most of the review is excellent quality and refers to authors own research on mouse model of IBD associated colorectal carcinogenesis. However as this review article has ambition to goes beyond of mouse model, more work needs to be done on review of IBD-CRC incidence/ risk and available prevention therapies. To avoid confusion it would be best to separate data regarding mouse model from human data. There is also a lack of logical flow with regards to other tumours Future proposed therapies could be expanded to new data eg on tofacitinib.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7477

**Title:** STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Inflammation Associated Colorectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 00068443

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-20 20:27

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-02 22:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting overview of the literature related to STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Colorectal Cancer. The paper is clearly written and contains valuable information. I suggest that the article can be published in the form of review in world J Gastroenterology.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7477

**Title:** STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Inflammation Associated Colorectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 00057684

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-20 20:27

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-03 15:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper, the authors discuss the crosstalk among IL6, STAT3 and S1P receptor pathways that regulate tumor inflammation in intestine and the importance of S1P. They provide a rationale for S1P as a possible target therapy. Overall the paper is well and succinctly written. However, it needs to include more recent research articles.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7477

**Title:** STAT3 and Sphingosine-1-phosphate in Inflammation Associated Colorectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 00068574

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-20 20:27

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-08 23:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The present review is dealing with the role of inflammation in the development and progression of colorectal cancer and particularly on the connection between stat3 and the shingosine kinase/shingosine 1 phosphate/ shingosine 1 phosphate receptor pathway. This review is fairly comprehensive and reflects major recent studies but there are many english errors and the phrasing is rather cumbersome. Minor recommendations In references 29, 55 and 81, the year has been omitted. References 89 and 90 are incomplete