

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9605

Title: Phenol-based endoscopic ultrasound-guided celiac plexus neurolysis for alcohol-intolerant cancer patients

Reviewer code: 00183279

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-02-20 08:38

Date reviewed: 2014-03-06 10:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

EUS guided CPN is an evolution from percutaneous CPN, with an efficacy and acceptability well documented by many metaanalysis; however your study raises some queries which need to be addressed upon. 1.The study lacks the numeral standards for statistical significance. 2.Chemoradiation has shown to influence the efficacy of CPN; none of your patients in alcoholic group ,and almost all the patients in phenolic group received it: the superior results in the phenolic group could be attributed to it thou. 3.The tables lack the arrangement and assortment with many p-values missing in conjoint groups. 4.The bias in technique of CPN, in alcoholic and phenolic group can't be nullified. 5.The study would be better served if the patient's were randomized to different neurolytics. 6.Were pre-operative antibiotics used in any of the groups and if not why, and how you decided not to use any local anesthetic in phenolic group, not knowing whether it would cause immediate pain or not. 7.What were post procedural criteria for a successful CPN. 8.The study needs some EUS picto-graphs; pre and post-procedural of phenolic and alcoholic groups.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9605

Title: Phenol-based endoscopic ultrasound-guided celiac plexus neurolysis for alcohol-intolerant cancer patients

Reviewer code: 02468626

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-02-20 08:38

Date reviewed: 2014-03-09 21:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors presented the use of phenol as injectate in EUS-CPN as an alternative to ethanol. The technique is original and it has not been reported previously. Major remarks 1) The rationale for using phenol has been found in alcohol intolerance among Asian population. I would suggest to emphasize this aspect in the title. 2) The main limitation is represented by the small number of patients. Thus I suggest to call this article "pilot study". As a consequence I would recommend to change the title as follows: Phenol-based endoscopic ultrasound-guided celiac plexus neurolysis for east-Asian alcohol-intolerant cancer patients: a pilot study. Minor remarks 1) Table 2 and 3 are not needed as they replicate data reported in the text



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com <http://www.wjgnet.com>

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9605

Title: Phenol-based endoscopic ultrasound-guided celiac plexus neurolysis for alcohol-intolerant cancer patients

Reviewer code: 02542616

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-02-20 08:38

Date reviewed: 2014-03-16 16:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear author your work is valuable and interesting.