

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6944

Title: Recurrence of hepatitis C after liver transplantation: past, present and future.

Reviewer code: 02526058

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-01 11:40

Date reviewed: 2013-11-11 20:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article of Dumortier et al. presents an adequate overview of the current literature and knowledge of natural history, treatment and prevention of recurrent hepatitis C after liver transplantation. However some changes and additional comments are required to improve the importance and significance of the article: 1. Title and subtitles do not accurately reflect the therein described topics, particularly the partitions in "past, present and future" are not convincing; I would recommend the following changes: Title such as: "Natural history, treatment and prevention of hepatitis C recurrence after liver transplantation: past, present and future" Subtitles such as: a) "Natural history of HCV recurrence after LT" b) "Treatment of HCV recurrence after LT: past and present" c) "Treatment and prevention of HCV recurrence after LT: future perspectives" 2. Section "Natural history...": The authors should add a comment on what could be the best way to treat an acute rejection in the setting of HCV recurrence after LT and more importantly they should focus on the clinical and histopathological difficulties to differentiate between acute rejection and HCV recurrence after LT (amongst others see Regev et al. Liver Transplantation, Vol 10, No 10 (October), 2004: pp 1233-1239). 3. Section "Treatment of HCV...": a) The authors should discuss the virological response rates of Boceprevir vs. Telaprevir as reported in the paper of Coilly et al. (ref. 102) in comparison to the results obtained by Pungapong et al. (ref. 101). b) The article of Werner et al. (Liver Transpl. 2012 Dec;18(12):1464-70) should be cited (first full paper publication on safety, efficacy and drug-drug interactions in patients receiving Telaprevir triple therapy after LT). c) The article of Fontana et al. (Am J Transplant. 2013 Jun;13(6):1601-5) should be cited (first case report in interferon free DAA therapy of FCH after LT). 4. Section "Prevention of HCV...": a) To reinforce the really



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

important point of the impact on morbidity and mortality during emerging HCV treatments also the publication of Deuffic-Burban et al. (Gastroenterology 2012; 143:974-985) should be mentioned and cited. b) At the end of this or the previous section a comment or may be a recommendation should be given to the readership how to treat HCV after LT under the current circumstances/current therapeutic availabilities (e.g. ...refuse therapy and await new drugs?, ...treatment only in special patients?, ...dual or triple therapy?,...preference for TVR or BOC?) 5. Please check again the manuscript carefully for some typing errors. 6. Beyond that, also a careful language polishing should be made by a native speaker.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6944

Title: Recurrence of hepatitis C after liver transplantation: past, present and future.

Reviewer code: 00183029

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-01 11:40

Date reviewed: 2013-11-19 08:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present manuscript review the natural history of HCV recurrence after liver transplantation, including risk factors for disease progression, and on antiviral therapy. The authors suggested possible ways to improve final long-term results of liver transplantation for HCV-related liver disease. Comments: This is a diligent review study of the results and management of HCV-related liver disease undergoing liver transplantation. The manuscript was generally well written with some innovative ideas and concepts.