

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8423

Title: Post liver transplant HCV recurrence: an unresolved thorny problem

Reviewer code: 00504591

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-12-28 17:38

Date reviewed: 2013-12-29 18:28

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article entitled, "Post liver transplant HCV recurrence: an unresolved thorny problem" by Grassi A et al., summarized the recent topics of the recurrent hepatitis C in liver transplant recipients, focusing on the viral dynamics after liver transplant, differential diagnosis of it from acute cellular rejection, the role of host genetic and immune response, and immunosuppressant/graft-related factors. I have some comments. Comments 1. There are many grammatical errors and inappropriate descriptions in the text. Please perform English proof-reading by native before resubmitting the manuscript. 2. The section "Early dynamics of graft HCV reinfection post LT". Some headings, such as "Genotype of HCV" and "Quasispecies of HCV" should be made for easy-reading. 3. The section, "Host immune response", is well written and comprehensive, making the present review distinguished from other reviews. Please make a summarizing table enabling comprehensive overview of the update perceptive of each immune-cell line.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8423

Title: Post liver transplant HCV recurrence: an unresolved thorny problem

Reviewer code: 00504119

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-12-28 17:38

Date reviewed: 2014-01-01 00:53

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To improve results add a table with host immune responses

To correct english