



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8758

Title: MicroRNA-218 is upregulated in gastric cancer after CRS plus HIPEC

Reviewer code: 00042073

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-06 19:24

Date reviewed: 2014-01-14 21:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

very good basic science paper, need more patient to validated the tool, to make the marker clinical usefull



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8758

Title: MicroRNA-218 is upregulated in gastric cancer after CRS plus HIPEC

Reviewer code: 01800331

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-06 19:24

Date reviewed: 2014-03-01 02:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study with both in vivo and in vitro data. The discover of miR-218 was based on microarray results, hence the clinical significance is good. For a minor comments, we suggest that you should verify the microarray results (not only miR-218, but also including the first five or more up-regulated microRNAs) in more than 5 blood samples.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8758

Title: MicroRNA-218 is upregulated in gastric cancer after CRS plus HIPEC

Reviewer code: 02445436

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-06 19:24

Date reviewed: 2014-03-01 23:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, Zhang and coauthors try to demonstrate that miRNA-218 regulation is involved in gastric cancer growth, by using clinical, in vivo and in vitro models. Three different approaches that would provide an interesting picture if they had developed to a sufficient depth. Major concerns At a conceptual level, many miRNAs are overexpressed (from 3 to 5 fold) in serum after surgery. Aside from the miRNA-218, the others disappear from any consideration. Moreover, How can we be sure that these miRNAs in serum are produced by tumor cells and not, for example, by the immune system? The number of patients is really low to draw conclusions; Methods are not detailed enough to understand how the experiment described were performed. For example, "specific primer" is not enough. Their sequence should be indicated, at least in supplementary materials. How many BALB/c nude mice were used? Minor points "300 nm of each specific forward and reverse primers" nm is a length unit. Maybe nM? Specific primer is not enough. Their sequence should be indicated, at least in supplementary materials. Literature cited regarding gastric cancer and miRNA is not well updated. For example, miR-101 is completely missing. It should be added in the introduction section (Carvalho et al., Lack of microRNA-101 causes E-cadherin functional deregulation through EZH2 up-regulation in intestinal gastric cancer. J Pathol. 2012 Sep;228(1):31-44.; He et al., Downregulation of miR-101 in gastric cancer correlates with cyclooxygenase-2 overexpression and tumor growth.FEBS J. 2012 Nov;279(22):4201-12)

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8758

Title: MicroRNA-218 is upregulated in gastric cancer after CRS plus HIPEC

Reviewer code: 00202869

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-06 19:24

Date reviewed: 2014-03-05 23:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript describes the identification of microRNA-218 (miR-218) as a tumor suppressor for gastric cancer. miRNA microarray and q-RT-PCR studies of 5 gastric cancer patients showed the upregulation of miR-218 after CRS+HIPEC. Overexpression of miR-218 in gastric cancer cell line SGC7901 suppressed its growth rate, increased the chemosensitivity to cisplatin, and impaired the tumor growth in a xenograft mice model. The results are convincing. The manuscript is worthy of consideration for publication. However, several issues need to be addressed before publication. Major issues: 1. Fig.2: a correlation between miRNA microarray and q-RT-PCR data for the four micro-RNAs is needed to support the conclusion that the RT-PCR results were consistent with the microarray data, given that miR-96 data was not provided in Table 2. 2. Fig.3: the authors need provide the data regarding to the expression levels of miR-218 in the parental SGC7901 and the SGC7901/miR218 stable cell line. 3. Fig.4: it seems that the authors use mTOR transition transfection to reveal the synergistic effect of mTOR and miR-218. mTOR is mammalian target of rapamycin. The description in results section is confusing and need to be rewritten for clarity. 4. Page 11 Discussion: the authors discuss their bioinformatics results, but neither reference was cited nor data was shown. 5. Table 2: is there any miRNAs down-regulated significantly? Minor issues: 1. Title: the title is confusing. please revise to "MicroRNA-218 is upregulated in gastric cancer patients after cytoreductive surgery and hyperthermic intraperitoneal chemotherapy, and increases chemosensitivity to cisplatin" 2. Introduction: details about the HIPEC regime should be provided. 3. Accuracy is essential to the validity of all scientific papers. a. Introduction: the authors state that "...the finding that 50% of miRNA-encoding genes are located in cancer-associated genomic regions



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

or fragile sites" (Page 5; also in Page 11). Is this applicable to all tumors? Please restrict the statement to the specific cancers reported in these references. b. Page 9: the authors state that "miR-218 is commonly downregulated in gastric cancers...". Please cite references for this. 4. Replace all DPP with cisplatin. Too many abbreviations reduced the clarity of the manuscript. 5. Grammar errors: the authors need pay special attention to eliminate these errors and to improve clarity of the paper. e.g., Line 9 page 5: "...research is needed to the contribution..." should be "...research is needed to examine the contribution...".