

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10737**Title:** Bovine Immunoglobulin Protein Isolates for the Nutritional Management of Enteropathy**Reviewer code:** 01434943**Science editor:** Na Ma**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-17 02:33**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-17 10:14

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an important and timely review of Immunoglobulin protein isolates and their therapeutic application. Parts of the abstract are a little over simplified. It gives the impression that enteropathy is a single entity for which 'effective therapies are not available'. However, there are some excellent therapies for certain forms of enteropathy. Similarly it could be argued that 'immunoglobulin-containing preparations offer a new strategy'. Passive immunizations and colostrum-based approaches for health promotion have been conducted for many decades. Nevertheless, the remainder of the review is thorough and balanced, giving a solid critique of immunoglobulin isolates. Some further discussion of hyper-immune colostrum vaccines would be useful (eg against rotavirus). Similarly, some discussion of other species would be useful (eg equine: Jenvey et al 2012).

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10737**Title:** Bovine Immunoglobulin Protein Isolates for the Nutritional Management of Enteropathy**Reviewer code:** 01298827**Science editor:** Na Ma**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-17 02:33**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-18 03:10

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review of preclinical and clinical studies supporting the use of bovine immunoglobulin isolates to improve gut health. The review is complete, very well written, and appears unbiased. There is one conspicuous omission in that radiation enteropathy (see, for example, Hauer-Jensen, Nature Reviews Gastroenterol Hepatol) is not mentioned. This may be because there are no studies with PPC or SBI addressing this disease, but because of the high prevalence of radiation enteropathy it would be prudent to at least mention it in the Abstract as well as in the Introduction. All in all, this manuscript is very good.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10737

Title: Bovine Immunoglobulin Protein Isolates for the Nutritional Management of Enteropathy

Reviewer code: 00034179

Science editor: Na Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-04-17 02:33

Date reviewed: 2014-04-30 17:59

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written review which examines the protective role of oral serum-derived bovine immunoglobulin administration in intestinal inflammation. An almost comprehensive literature was produced and data of the most important published studies have been well reported. However, more information is needed about the mechanism of action of PPC/SBI that modulates the mucosal immune response, particularly through the interaction with immune population subsets present in the intestinal mucosa. Regarding this point, I suggest to consider two studies of Perez-Bosque and Moreto group, that are. 1.Perez-Bosque, A. et al. 2004. Dietary plasma protein affects the immune response of weaned rats challenged with *S. aureus* superantigen B. J. Nutr. 134:2667-2672;. 2.Pérez-Bosque A, Moretó M. A rat model of mild intestinal inflammation induced by *Staphylococcus aureus* enterotoxin B. Proc Nutr Soc. 2010 Aug;69(3):447-53. Finally, I suggest to insert a figure that summarize the mechanisms of action by which PPC/SBI can interact with immune cells present in the mucosa, thus trying to downregulate the intestinal inflammation.