

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8977

Title: Association between serum alpha-fetoprotein levels and fatty liver disease: a large cross-sectional study from China

Reviewer code: 02462668

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-14 18:22

Date reviewed: 2014-01-27 21:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reports association of increased serum alpha-fetoprotein (AFP) levels with fatty liver disease (FLD) in Chinese population. The authors' main finding is that AFP acts as a cofactor but not as an independent factor for FLD. Specific comments: 1. Hepatocyte proliferation during liver regeneration is associated with dedifferentiation of mature hepatocytes and temporarily increased expression of AFP in the liver. In NAFLD/NASH, the degree of apoptosis of hepatocytes is known to be elevated. Thus, it would be valuable to correlate AFP levels with some markers of hepatocyte cell death (e. g. 30 kDa fragments of cytokeratin 18). 2. Liver biopsy is the gold standard for histological diagnosis of NAFLD/FLD. Were any patients also examined by liver biopsy? If so is there any correlation between the level of AFP and the histological severity of the disease? 3. In some parts of the manuscript, it is not clear whether you discuss alcoholic, non-alcoholic or both etiologies of FLD. Dividing FLD group into ALD and NAFLD would give the reader more information. 4. In the discussion, you state that "FLD is a common liver disease that affects more than one third of world's population." Do you mean NAFLD or FLD in general? Do you really mean general world's population? Or adult population of some countries? In this case authors should identify the source the information quoted. 5. Did all subjects give informed consent for participation in the study? Minor comments: 6. All abbreviations should be explained in the text (HDL-C, PIVKAI) and in each table/figure (IQR). 7. I would recommend using the median value instead of the mean for the age.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8977

Title: Association between serum alpha-fetoprotein levels and fatty liver disease: a large cross-sectional study from China

Reviewer code: 01798415

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-14 18:22

Date reviewed: 2014-01-29 22:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Ping Xu et al. investigated the association of serum alpha-fetoprotein (AFP) levels with fatty liver disease (FLD) in a Chinese population. This large cross-sectional study was well designed and the methods were valid. The results suggested that serum AFP levels are significantly associated with FLD, and AFP acts as a cofactor but not as an independent factor for FLD. Although there were several limitations in this study as the authors have mentioned in the discussion, the observations are useful for physicians to monitor serum AFP levels for screening of HCC in FLD patients. I have only a few suggestions, which may help improve the manuscript: 1. Page 2, line 14-15, "Our results suggested that serum AFP levels are significantly associated with FLD, and AFP acts as a cofactor but not as an independent factor for FLD." should be "Our results suggested that serum AFP levels were significantly associated with FLD, and AFP acted as a cofactor but not as an independent factor for FLD." 2. Page 6, line 19-20, "Subjects with FLD had a higher serum AFP levels..." should be "Subjects with FLD had higher serum AFP levels..." 3. Page 6, line 20-21, "A significantly association between serum AFP levels with metabolic syndrome" should be "A significantly association between serum AFP levels and metabolic syndrome". 4. Page 6, line 22, "elevated serum AFP levels was associated with an increased risk for FLD." should be "elevated serum AFP levels were associated with an increased risk for FLD."

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8977

Title: Association between serum alpha-fetoprotein levels and fatty liver disease: a large cross-sectional study from China

Reviewer code: 01566093

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-01-14 18:22

Date reviewed: 2014-02-08 00:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors observed that serum AFP levels were significantly increased in subjects with FLD, and AFP levels were significantly associated with metabolic parameters, suggesting that AFP acts as a cofactor but not as an independent factor for FLD. 1) The scientific innovation of this study is limited since similar studies have been published in many Journals (Hepatol Int. 3: 551-5552009 and Eur Rev Med Pharmacol2013; 17 (11): 1536-1541.). However, this study has been done in Chinese Population and may have some clinical significance. The authors should add more data onto the manuscript to clarify what are the differences between NAFLD and alcoholic fatty liver disease and the difference in different stages of disease? Is there any association between pathological changes and AFP level? 2) The discussion is too simple. Author should discuss and explore the possible mechanisms and clinical implications