

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6717

Title: Factors affecting effectiveness of vaccination against hepatitis B virus in hemodialysis patients

Reviewer code: 00034635

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-28 11:54

Date reviewed: 2013-12-16 03:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review on factors influencing effectiveness of HBV vaccination in hemodialysis patients. Although focused on HBV vaccination, other strategies of prevention should be discussed. Major comments. 1. HBV vaccination for all patients with decreased GFR should be considered before they reach ESRD. Immunogenicity is better preserved at this stage. 2. Discuss measures such as individualized HD machines for HBV carriers 3. Please, discuss the possibility of administering LAM prophylaxis for those seronegative patients undergoing HD in HBV high prevalence areas. Minor Comments. 1. References should be unified under the Vancouver style. 2. Text should be shortened. Please, use tables as needed to reduce the text.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6717

Title: Factors affecting effectiveness of vaccination against hepatitis B virus in hemodialysis patients

Reviewer code: 00503536

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-28 11:54

Date reviewed: 2013-12-17 21:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review manuscript written by Eleftheriadis et al. summarizes the current status on vaccination against HBV in hemodialysis patients. The review is comprehensive and well written. However, it would be better if the authors describes more on the immunological mechanisms responsible for the poor response of HBV vaccination in those patients. Moreover, a summary table showing clinical trials attempting to increase the efficacy of HBV vaccine should be added. Minor point The meaning of the sentence in page 5, line 3-5 "Nevertheless, only one dose is required in patients with initial" is unclear and it needs to be revised.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6717

Title: Factors affecting effectiveness of vaccination against hepatitis B virus in hemodialysis patients

Reviewer code: 00070833

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-28 11:54

Date reviewed: 2013-12-30 02:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The main issue of this paper (Factors affecting effectiveness of vaccination against hepatitis B virus in hemodialysis patients) has not been addressed before and is therefore of interest. Although focused on HBV vaccination and HD procedure, host immunological mechanisms responsible for the poor response of vaccination against HBV should be discussed more detailed. Major comments. 1. Why the hemodialysis patients have higher rate to become chronic carriers after the initial HBV infection? 2. It might be necessary that early antiviral therapy against HBV and individualized HD machines for HBV carriers. 3. it would be better if the authors show main clinical trials attempting to increase the efficacy of HBV vaccine in a summary table. Minor Comments. 1. Throughout the manuscript there are editorial and linguistic problems. Careful re-reading is necessary to correct all the misspelling and grammar. 2. The authors should unified the reference(s) with standard style.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6717

Title: Factors affecting effectiveness of vaccination against hepatitis B virus in hemodialysis patients

Reviewer code: 00069294

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-28 11:54

Date reviewed: 2013-12-31 03:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article well analyses the issue of HBV vaccination in a selected subgroup of patients, those submitted to hemodialysis. Major concerns: -the English needs a revision. There are several mistakes throughout the whole article (e.g. titres instead of titers, is indicating in the abstract, hyperparathyroidism) -the article presents no figures/tables. I think that a figure illustrating the main factors affecting HBV vaccination efficacy in HD patients and the measures that could overcome the problem could make the article more appealing for the reader. Nevertheless, a table summing up types of available vaccines, and the main studies in which they have been tested is absolutely necessary. Minor concerns: -the authors state that although 30% of HBV carriers develop histologically confirmed chronic hepatitis, only 5% die from liver disease. The causes of mortality should be explicated and discussed (infections? ESRD?). - the authors state that life threatening exacerbations and increased rates of liver disease were reported in renal transplant recipients who were asymptomatic during HD. I reasonably argue that this is due to the immunosuppression following transplantation. This point needs to be discussed. -the authors discuss the role of HCV carriage state does in affecting immune response to HBV; is there any study in HIV infected HD patients reporting the response to vaccination? This information should be reported. - Why the decay rate of anti-HBs titers in the PD patients is faster than that in the HD group? Is it due to protein loss? Please explain. -Is there any long-term efficacy data on HB-AS02 and third generation vaccines? Could you please explain vaccines side effects of these new generations of vaccines? Data should be added to summing-up table.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6717

Title: Factors affecting effectiveness of vaccination against hepatitis B virus in hemodialysis patients

Reviewer code: 00503560

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-28 11:54

Date reviewed: 2014-01-05 09:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article described factors affecting HB vaccination in hemodialysis (HD) patients, because the seroprotection rate is relatively low, at about 70%. Authors summarized the background of HD patients as well as several factors that affect HBV vaccine efficacy. The manuscript was well-written, but some minor revisions were needed. Minor comments; 1. Authors described three main parts; patient-associated factors, Dialysis associated factors, and vaccine associated factors. As there were too many factors affecting HBV vaccine efficacy, authors should summarize each risk factor and its reference in Table. It is easy for general readers to understand the risk factors in Table. 2. In the first part, authors described several protocols of HBV vaccination to improve the efficacy in references 20 to 37, as well as new protocols with adjuvants as shown in page 10. Please summarize these protocols in Table (not only text). In fact, the new protocols with adjuvants would be effective, but some adverse events were reported. Authors should describe the AEs in text.