

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5924

Title: IMPACT OF IMMUNOSUPPRESSION MINIMIZATION AND WITHDRAWAL IN LONG-TERM HCV LIVER TRANSPLANT RECIPIENTS

Reviewer code: 00047453

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 10:57

Date reviewed: 2013-12-14 23:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The course of hepatitis C infection after liver transplantation (OLT) is influenced by the immunosuppression (IS). IS withdrawal could benefit these patients by delaying the pregression of liver damage. The impact of IS withdrawal has only been evaluated by the Tor Vergata group in Rome. This interesting paper introduces three groups of patients after OLT: (CNI group; MMF group and TOL group). The numbers are small and it is a retrospective study. Authors do not describe the total number of patients transplanted in the center from 1993 to 2013 (total number, and HCV patients) to better understand how many were included in this study. All were cadaveric OLT? Living related? There could be significant bias in the groups. The authors do not give detailed information on the history of the groups in the immediate post OLT period (how many had rejection after OLT, how many received boluses of steroids, or antibodies after OLT, CMV infection, etc). Table 1 is almost illegible but apparently it says that they had no rejection episodes?.... What was the reason for being only with MMF (renal insufficiency only ?? How bad was it) Table 1 is almost illegible: Please redo.... the table.... is important to put donor age, amount of steatosis of donor livers, ischemia times, CMV infection post OLT?, etc as they are variables important for the evolution of hepatitis C after OLT. Other consideration: There is one patient in the MMF group with hep B and C cirrosis.....this patient should be removed from the group (confound)

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5924

Title: IMPACT OF IMMUNOSUPPRESSION MINIMIZATION AND WITHDRAWAL IN LONG-TERM HCV LIVER TRANSPLANT RECIPIENTS

Reviewer code: 01808903

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 10:57

Date reviewed: 2013-12-23 15:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript must be re-submitted with tables clearly reported and readable.