



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9577

Title: Abnormal beta-catenin immunohistochemical expression as a prognostic factor in gastric cancer: a meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 02456472

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-02-18 20:38

Date reviewed: 2014-03-01 21:48

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, RECOMMENDATION, CONCLUSION. It lists various grades (A-E) and corresponding actions like 'Accept', 'High priority for publication', 'Rejection', 'Minor revision', and 'Major revision'.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors chose a significant topic in clinics, and used the method of meta-analysis to evaluate the effect of beta-catenin immunohistochemical expression in the prognosis of gastric cancer. However, lots of drawbacks appeared in the manuscript. Literature Search The search terms were not complete, such as "stomach cancer/ carcinoma/ neoplasm/tumor" were not included. In addition, whether free text and MeSH search for keywords were employed? 2. Data extraction and assessment What are the content of "the Newcastle-Ottawa quality assessment scale" Each item of it and the responded score should be listed. Statistical analysis (1) Which statistical model was used, free or fixed model? (2) What is the threshold of heterogeneity test, P<0.05 or P<0.1? 4. Discussion The authors did not explain the results very clearly, and did not compare with the results of other studies. Such as "abnormal beta-catenin expressions were correlated with and clinicopathological features including Lauren classification, lymph node metastasis, distant metastasis, but not TNM stage". The authors should explain the negative results, too. Figures and tables Figure 1, the number is nor correct, please check it. Tables, please add some notes to make them be understood easier. 6. Some places of the article were hard to understand, which need to be revised.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9577

Title: Abnormal β -catenin immunohistochemical expression as a prognostic factor in gastric cancer: a meta-analysis

Reviewer code: 00504161

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2014-02-18 20:38

Date reviewed: 2014-03-03 17:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is interesting, but needs an accurate language revision. Page 3 - the acronym Wnt should be define.