

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9337

Title: Surgical resection of a gastric adenocarcinoma after neoadjuvant trastuzumab combined with oxaliplatin and capecitabine medication: a case report

Reviewer code: 00183665

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2014-02-10 12:11

Date reviewed: 2014-02-12 06:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The case report involves the treatment of a patient with gastric cancer treated with a already described neo-adjuvant protocol. There is no general diagnostic challenge in reading the manuscript for the general reader of WJGE. The follow-up interval is too short to claim any benefit after this extensive resection.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9337

Title: Surgical resection of a gastric adenocarcinoma after neoadjuvant trastuzumab combined with oxaliplatin and capecitabine medication: a case report

Reviewer code: 00070261

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2014-02-10 12:11

Date reviewed: 2014-02-12 11:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report describes a case of HER-2 overexpressing advanced gastric carcinoma successfully treated with surgery and combined chemotherapy of trastuzumab, oxaliplatin and capecitabine. The manuscript is well written and provides some information that is potentially useful to readers. I have only minor comments. 1. Please give information on the toxicity related to chemotherapy. 2. Observation period of 1 year is too short to evaluate treatment outcome.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9337

Title: Surgical resection of a gastric adenocarcinoma after neoadjuvant trastuzumab combined with oxaliplatin and capecitabine medication: a case report

Reviewer code: 00742250

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2014-02-10 12:11

Date reviewed: 2014-02-16 17:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Recently, the case presentations have been reported that trastuzumab is effective on HER-2 positive gastric cancer. Accumulation of such a successful case is important for the clinical practice. The case report has a scientific value to be published in World Journal of Gastroenterology. Please revise the present title to "Surgical resection of an advanced gastric cancer following a combination therapy of trastuzumab, oxaliplatin and capecitabine".