ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7337
Title: Clinical impact of minimal cancer detection from various specimens in colorectal cancer
Reviewer code: 00068527
Science editor: Su-Xin Gou
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 17:01
Date reviewed: 2013-12-20 21:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ] Rejection
[Y] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[Y] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this mini-review the Authors reviewed some retrospective studies focused on the prognostic significance of detection of tumor cells in lymph nodes and/or peripheral blood from patients suffering for resectable or metastatic colorectal cancer (CRC). In particular, they reported and discussed the results obtained using methods (including immunohistochemistry, RT-PCR and the CellSearcTM System) that detect tumor cells through the analysis of cancer-related biomarkers (including CEA, CKs, hTERT, CD133, K-ras, and MUC2). They conclude remarking the prognostic utility of minimal tumor cell detection in lymph nodes or peripheral blood from these patients and highlight the need of developing innovative and low-cost methodologies, usable in clinical routine Even if the idea of a "Highlight Topic" on this issue is interesting, there are two crucial and major criticisms that make this mini-review unacceptable in the present form: 1) Throughout the manuscript, the English is very poor, and often not intelligible. The manuscript must be completely re-written with the help of a native English auditor 2) Some references are not updated and the Authors define as "recent", studies that were published more than 20 years ago, and as "novel", methodologies, such as OSNA, that have been developed and in use already since more than 10 years. As I wrote above, the idea of this mini-review is stimulating, but it should mainly discuss recent data or otherwise correlate (or compare) the older data with the more recent ones. From this point of view, it has not been discussed adequately (or maybe it is not clear for problems related to the not fluent English) how the knowledge on the topic of this review has progressed over the past 20 years: the recent results should be emphasized more than the less recent ones, and this would improve the originality and, consequently, the quality of this mini-review Without an adequate revision of

these two major points the manuscript is not acceptable for publication

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7337
Title: Clinical impact of minimal cancer detection from various specimens in colorectal cancer
Reviewer code: 00058455
Science editor: Su-Xin Gou
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 17:01
Date reviewed: 2013-12-24 20:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[Y] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a short review article with well description of the current development of minimal cancer detection in colorectal cancer.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7337
Title: Clinical impact of minimal cancer detection from various specimens in colorectal cancer
Reviewer code: 00070191
Science editor: Su-Xin Gou
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 17:01
Date reviewed: 2013-12-26 15:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Because the term '' minimal cancer'' is not appropriate, the title of the study should be corrected as '' Clinical impact of minimal cancer cell detection from various specimens in colorectal cancer ''. 2. Detection methods should be described with more details.   3. The manuscript is poorly written and contains a number of typographical/grammatical errors.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7337
Title: Clinical impact of minimal cancer detection from various specimens in colorectal cancer
Reviewer code: 00041675
Science editor: Su-Xin Gou
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 17:01
Date reviewed: 2013-12-27 16:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
Language revision is rgreatly needed.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7337
Title: Clinical impact of minimal cancer detection from various specimens in colorectal cancer
Reviewer code: 00070758
Science editor: Su-Xin Gou
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 17:01
Date reviewed: 2014-01-03 17:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of	[ ] No records	publication
[Y] Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	[Y]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[Y] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper submitted by Kazuhiko Yoshimatsu et al. and named "Clinical impact of minimal cancer detection from various specimens in colorectal cancer" is presenting different molecular diagnostic methods for the detection of minimal colorectal cancer cells from various specimens. This minireview deals with topic which attracts the attention of all scientists, involved in cancer diagnostics and treatment. However, I believe that the authors must completely reevaluate this paper and consult the English language with a native speaker. There are hundreds of grammatical errors!!! In addition, the presentation of this very interesting diagnostic problem should be evaluated much more deeply. In conclusion, it is too early for this publication. If the authors completely revise the paper, it could be further re-submitted as a new paper.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7337
Title: Clinical impact of minimal cancer detection from various specimens in colorectal cancer
Reviewer code: 02533652
Science editor: Su-Xin Gou
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 17:01
Date reviewed: 2014-04-13 22:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
Please do check the typos and also cite the tables within the text of the paper. And do change the sentence "Here we report the findings of our mini-review evaluating the prognostic significance of molecular tumor cell detection in lymph node specimens and PB samples"