



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9102

Title: Mycobacterium avium Paratuberculosis in the etiology of Crohn’s disease, cause or epiphenomenon?

Reviewer code: 00058696

Science editor: Ma,Na

Date sent for review: 2014-01-21 20:49

Date reviewed: 2014-02-28 23:32

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, RECOMMENDATION, CONCLUSION. It contains a grid of checkboxes for grading and recommendation options.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review provides an analysis of the literature behind the “MAP hypothesis” infective theory, and an overview of supporting and contradictory evidence. However, there are grammatical errors and run-on sentences throughout the article, which makes it difficult to read at times and fully understand all of the points being made by the authors. We have provided some suggestions below. Abstract Page 3, line 5: Would first write out subspecies in its entirety before abbreviating. Page 3, line 6: Remove “the” between “if” and “MAP” Page 3, line 8: Numerous times throughout the manuscript the word “evidences” appears, however the plural form of this word does not end with an ‘s’. It should read “illustrating the evidence”. Page 3, line 13-15: This sentence is unclear, especially the part of “singularly or in association”. What does this refer to? Suggest rewriting. Page 3, line 16: Change to “evidence” Page 3, line 17: Change “need” to “needs” Core Tip Page 4, line 4: Would write out subspecies in its entirety, and paratuberculosis should not be capitalized. Page 4, line 5: Remove “the” between “if” and “MAP” Page 4, line 7: Change to “evidence” Page 4, line 8: Remove “analyzing” Page 4, line 9-10: This sentence should read “In particular, new mechanistic findings seem to encourage the CD-MAP relationship.” Manuscript: Page 5, line 2: Would not capitalize bowel disease nor colitis. Page 5, line 13: Remove “the” between “of” and “MAP” Page 5, line 16-18: Change it to “Since the 1980s”. Need to write out ‘80s. This sentence is unclear, would suggest rewording. Page 5, line 19-20: This sentence is unclear and does not flow with the paragraph. Suggest rewriting. Page 6, line 5: Do not capitalize kansasii Page 6, line 6: The correct spelling is “Cytomegalovirus” Page 6, line 7: Change this sentence to ...”none were accepted due to lack of firm



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

evidence." Page 6, line 15: Change "have" to "has now". Add "a" between "as" and "possible". Page 6, line 18: Do not capitalize coli Page 6, line 22: Add "the" between "demolish" and "intestinal" Page 6, line 24: Add "which" following "IL-8," Page 6, line 25: Remove "at the end" Page 6-7, line 25-1: This sentence is unclear, would suggest rewording. Page 7, line 4: Do not capitalize coli Page 7, line 14: Start sentence with "Similar to Mycobacterium tuberculosis..." instead of "As" Page 7, line 18: Add "has" between "association" and "aroused". Change to "since the 1980s" Page 7, line 19: Change "Basing" to "Based" Page 8, line 7: Change "highlight" to "highlighted" Page 8, line 10: Would write out base pairs Page 8, line 12: Change to "variants" for plural form Page 8, line 21: Add "an" between "in" and "organism". Change "ileum" to "ileal". Page 8, line 25: Suggest rewording "worldly diffused". Page 9, line 3-7: Change sentence to read "This long-lasting incubation period depends on the level of environmental contamination (MAP exposure dose), the virulence of MAP strain, the capacity of a single animal of contracting the infection (immune response is more efficient with age), and genetic susceptibility..." It is not necessary to write "on" before each idea in the series. Page 9, line 9-10: This sentence is unclear, suggest rewording. Also, this is not correct use of word "ambient". Page 9, line 11: Change "exposition" to "exposure" Page 9, line 13-16: Change sentence to read "MAP's ability to spread through milk of infected animals is proven and it has been shown that this microorganism is able to survive routine pasteurization methods..." Page 9, line 16: Remove "the" between "in" and "human". Page 9, line 17: Remove "for humans" Page 9, line 17-19: This sentence is unclear, suggest rewording Page 9, line 21: Change to "evidence" Page 9, line 22: Change sentence to read "The MAP hypothesis in CD is considered to have originated in the 1980s when Chiodini..." Page 10, line 2: Change "guines" to "guinea" Page 10, line 2-3: Change the word



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9102

Title: Mycobacterium avium Paratuberculosis in the etiology of Crohn’s disease, cause or epiphenomenon?

Reviewer code: 00034489

Science editor: Ma,Na

Date sent for review: 2014-01-21 20:49

Date reviewed: 2014-03-14 16:33

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, RECOMMENDATION, CONCLUSION. It lists various grades (A-E) and corresponding evaluation criteria and search results.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors show the association between MAC and Crohn’s disease in their review article. The paper is well written and interesting. There are a few concerns with regards to the investigation. Please see below. 1) The scientific names should be used throughout the manuscript. In many cases, scientific names are italics. Please look at scientific names in detail. 2) The tables are poor. The tables should be improved to be easily understandable and informative. 3) In P16, the paragraph of “ In patients treated Infliximab.....” is unsuitable for the section of “Indirect methods for MAP detection”. 4) There are a few spelling errors. Please check the manuscript carefully.