

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9795

**Title:** High Frequency of Occult Hepatitis B Virus Infection Among Mexican HIV-1-Infected Patients

**Reviewer code:** 00000456

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-01 10:43

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-02 06:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

**GENERAL COMMENT** This study fails to include a control group (e.g. HIV/HCV coinfectd patients; non-viral chronic hepatitis) useful to compare the prevalence of occult hepatitis B. I am puzzled by the very high prevalence of occult hepatitis B in this series, which raises the possibility of false-positive results. Moreover, metabolic factors, such as steatosis have not been taken into consideration. A specific paragraph on the several limitations of this study needs to be added. Based on the many limitations of the study design

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS** I would suggest discussing all the following articles: Chadwick D. HIV Med. 2014;15:189-92. ; Tramuto F. Biomed Res Int. 2013;2013:859583. ; Said ZN. World J Gastroenterol. 2011;17:1927-38.; Loria P. Atherosclerosis. 2014 ;232:99-109.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9795

**Title:** High Frequency of Occult Hepatitis B Virus Infection Among Mexican HIV-1-Infected Patients

**Reviewer code:** 00504141

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-01 10:43

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-04 18:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Alvaez-Munoz et al have submitted a paper describing the occurrence of occult hepatitis B infection in a cohort of HIV positive individuals. The paper is concisely written. The paper is succinct and the discussion does not go beyond that permitted by the results. The study population is small, but the results are sufficient to perhaps merit an exploration in a bigger population. Given the high prevalence of OHBI in the populations and the small population size, the authors should address any issues relating to possible cohort bias. No information is given on the method of patient selection or otherwise; random, sequential.... Because of the relatively small numbers the study lacks certain power; however, the conclusions are appropriate. To emphasise the size of the study, the conclusion should again mention the number of patients involved. minor comment: inability, should be inability

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9795

**Title:** High Frequency of Occult Hepatitis B Virus Infection Among Mexican HIV-1-Infected Patients

**Reviewer code:** 02528139

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-01 10:43

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-11 21:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author investigated the presence of OHBI in 49 HIV-1/HBsAg- patients. They would like to determine the frequency of OHBI in HIV-1+/HBsAg- patients in Mexico. They used nested PCR or real time PCR to amplify a region of the C, S and X genes. They found that the OHBI frequency is high among Mexican HIV-1+/HBsAg- patients and is more frequency in patients with detectable HIV-RNA. The findings in this report are very important for managing HIV-1+/HBsAg patients. 1. Sample size is too small to determine the frequency of OHBI in HIV-1+/HBsAg- patients. They should include more patients. 2. They should show the frequency of OHBI in HIV-1-/HBsAg- population in the table 2.