

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6596

Title: Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00000774

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2013-10-25 19:25

Date reviewed: 2013-12-05 20:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a comprehensive review of biology of gastric cancer. Although the review covers the entire range of gastric carcinogenesis, it is, unfortunately, too long and redundant. In particular, similar arguments were described between the section 'ALTERED SIGNALING PATHWAYS IN GASTRIC CANCER' and the section 'GENETIC ALTERATIONS IN GASTRIC CANCER' or 'EPIGENETIC ALTERATIONS IN GASTRIC CANCER'. Authors should shorten the paper by reducing the three sections into one section of 'ALTERED SIGNALING PATHWAYS IN GASTRIC CANCER' with explanations of terminology such as MSI, CIN, LOH, mutation, epigenetic changes etc.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6596

Title: Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00057951

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2013-10-25 19:25

Date reviewed: 2013-12-23 09:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations on your fine and extensive work.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6596

Title: Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00227592

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2013-10-25 19:25

Date reviewed: 2013-12-23 19:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is not well organized. Extensive editing is needed before it can be published in WJG.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6596

Title: Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00058438

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2013-10-25 19:25

Date reviewed: 2014-02-08 17:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major concerns: 1.The section of "Risk Factors" (page 4): "Environmental Risk Factors" may be a better subtitle than "Risk Factors", and the authors should briefly focus on the interactions between environmental risk factors and pathogenetic mechanisms of gastric cancer. For being relevant to the subject of this review article, this section should be greatly revised. 2.Targets that can be detected in blood are mentioned in Table 2, and those that cannot be detected in blood or those without available data should be additionally mentioned. Minor concerns: 1.The section of "Risk Factors" (page 4): "The connection between H. pylori and GC is based on epidemiologic data and animal models." Not only from epidemiologic data and animal models, data from clinical trials have suggested that H. pylori eradication therapy can effectively reduce the development of precancerous lesions and gastric cancer. H. pylori infection is not the only risk factor but is one of the key risk factors. 2.The capitals of "Wnt" or "wnt" should be consistent. 3.There are some errors in grammar or spelling. For example, HDAC inhibitors (HDACis) now also "be" considered as potential therapeutics. "trichostatin" A (TSA) and suberoylanilide hydroxamic acid (SAHA) are the classic HDACis. "orinostsat" (SAHA), also known as suberoylanilide hydroxamic acid, is the first clinically approved HDACi, which has been recently approved for clinical use in CTCL (page 20). Carefully rechecking these errors is recommended.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6596

Title: Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 01438559

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2013-10-25 19:25

Date reviewed: 2014-02-10 15:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I enjoyed reading the review article by Dr Shi et al regarding the pathogenic mechanisms in gastric cancer. It covers a broad area of carcinogenesis of gastric cancer. I have a few comments on this article.

1. In the abstract, "the fourth most common cancer and the second leading cause of cancer" is maybe "second leading cause of cancer-related death?" 2. In the Risk Factors; it is known that specific strain of H.Pylori has been associated with high prevalence of gastric cancer. It would be better to comment on this. 3. Several abbreviations such as DNMTs or EGCG should be spelled out at first appearance.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6596

Title: Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 02495270

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2013-10-25 19:25

Date reviewed: 2014-02-11 00:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors provide an extensive review of the recent advances in our understanding of the molecular pathology of gastric cancer. The manuscript is timely and well written, easy to understand and deserves rapid publication. The authors should consider to describe in a separate paragraph the two main carcinogenetic cascades within gastric mucosa (intestinal vs diffuse) and their relative molecular alterations.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6596

Title: Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00033010

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2013-10-25 19:25

Date reviewed: 2014-02-13 19:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper of Jing Shi et al "Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer" is an overview of molecular pathways and risk factors involved in gastric cancer. The paper is exhaustive and all the molecular mechanisms are detailed. However, due to the complexity of the topic, the argumentation appears to be cumbersome, so that the attention of the reader could not be easily caught. Other comments are: ? Do diffuse and intestinal type carcinoma show activation of different pathways? Emphasizing different pathways in different types of tumors may increase the attractiveness of the paper. ? What about early gastric cancer? A section dedicated to this topic must be enclosed in the revised manuscript. ? It is known that Wnt-beta catenin pathway is involved in cell adhesion and migration and therefore may play a role in metastasis development. This aspect needs to be elucidated. ? The exact term is "cardias" instead of "cardia" (Latin derivation of the word). ? Gastric cancers grown in different stomach areas (cardias, antrum, body) may show different molecular pathways and probably a different pathogenesis. It is necessary to emphasize this aspect. ? May any of the cited molecules be considered as markers of good or bad prognosis? Have they been studied as bio-humoral indicators for an early diagnosis of cancer? Which of them are activated in pre-neoplastic conditions such as intestinal metaplasia and atrophy? Explanations of these points are due.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6596

Title: Pathogenetic mechanisms in gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00058401

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2013-10-25 19:25

Date reviewed: 2014-02-19 03:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations for the quality of the manuscript-liberatocaboclo