

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10583

Title: Advances in treatment of ulcerative colitis by herbs: from bench to bedside

Reviewer code: 00013033

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-08 15:59

Date reviewed: 2014-04-30 18:58

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review on the role of alternative medicine in UC. Authors concentrated on herbal products. Comments; 1. please critically appraise the published literature, study designs should be added for all studies with appropriate comments on patient numbers, definitions and statistical power. and evidence levels for the different formulations 2. please construct a Table with the most important studies from the field and add here authors, publication year, patient numbers, study design, definition of response/remission and outcome 3. Most studies were of limited statistical power this should be clearly highlighted in the conclusion 4. Search strategy for identification of relevant literature should be added according to the criteria of systematic reviews, please add also a Figure and explain how authors have identified the studies and how they ended up with the papers finally included.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10583

Title: Advances in treatment of ulcerative colitis by herbs: from bench to bedside

Reviewer code: 00506041

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-08 15:59

Date reviewed: 2014-05-02 18:13

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article "Advances in treatment of ulcerative colitis by herbs: from bench to bedside" is a fairly good review of the current state of things in alternative treatment of UC, particularly on the usage of herbal medicine. The article showed a great deal of information on the different herbal substances used in treatment of UC. But the article lacks some in depth reasoning and shows very little of the author's opinion or understanding of the matter at hand, instead it feels more like the compiling of research data. Perhaps the authors could talk about their thoughts at length in the last part of manuscript. Another weak point in this manuscript is the language, the authors need to polish up their sentences and look more closely on grammar issues. For example, "owning" is the derivative of "own", in the context of your abstract, you'll want to use "owing". And there is no such thing as "threatening the life quality" of patients, "lowering" would be more appropriate. In page 5 of the manuscript, you wrote "it is evidenced that the nuclear factor kappa B", surely you realize that "evidence" should never be used as a verb? Besides these minor mishaps, the article is of fairly good quality, please make the revisions as suggested. Good luck on your future research.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10583

Title: Advances in treatment of ulcerative colitis by herbs: from bench to bedside

Reviewer code: 00039636

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-08 15:59

Date reviewed: 2014-05-07 18:55

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, recently and potential effectiveness of herbs has been evaluated for the treatment of Ulcerative Colitis. Analyzed herbs include: aloe vera gel, butyrate, tormentil extracts, wheat grass juice, and curcumin. The structure of the review is not complete. A proper assessment of the studies would provide to follow the PRISMA statement for systematic reviews[1]. In addition, several drugs analyzed include different operating principles. For this reason, the best direction for orienting the revision would be to start from the “mode of operation”, rather than by the generic term of Herbs.

1) Liberati A1, Altman DG, Tetzlaff J, Mulrow C, Gøtzsche PC, Ioannidis JP, Clarke M, Devereaux PJ, Kleijnen J, Moher D. The PRISMA statement for reporting systematic reviews and meta-analyses of studies that evaluate health care interventions: explanation and elaboration. J Clin Epidemiol. 2009 Oct;62(10):e1-34. doi: 10.1016/j.jclinepi.2009.06.006.