

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9840

**Title:** PCOS as an independent risk factor for NAFLD: a review of the pathogenesis, diagnosis, and management

**Reviewer code:** 00011378

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-01 19:15

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-03 02:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The review of Kelley et al about PCOS and NAFLD is timely, comprehensive and well-written. Minor comments are outlined below mostly related with formal aspects. Citations should be revised. There are some important aspects that were meta-analyzed and these contributions are missing in different sections i.e. the association of NAFLD with carotid thickness and plaques (Sookoian S et al. Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease is strongly associated with carotid atherosclerosis: a systematic review. J Hepatol. 2008, 49(4):600-7) in CVD risk and NAFLD or in the role of OSA in NAFLD development (Sookoian S et al. Obstructive sleep apnea is associated with fatty liver and abnormal liver enzymes: a meta-analysis. Obes Surg. 2013 Nov;23(11):1815-25). Other problem is some citations are duplicated i.e. 15 and 41, which is an abstract and others present misspelling of the last name of authors, i.e. 34 . Regarding redaction, there are a lot of missing spaces between words and an effort to shortened would be welcome by the reader.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9840

**Title:** PCOS as an independent risk factor for NAFLD: a review of the pathogenesis, diagnosis, and management

**Reviewer code:** 00068156

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-01 19:15

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-04 10:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

In this review, the author discussed the association between NAFLD and polycystic ovary syndrome (PCOS), and risk factors for development of NAFLD in women with PCOS. The author further discussed the pathophysiology, screening, and finally management of NAFLD in this select group of women. This review analyzed systematically the links between the etiologic factors for NAFLD and PCOS. It is helpful for clinicians to understand deeply the pathogenesis of NAFLD, and to identify and administrate the patients with PCOS that may be at higher risk for NAFLD.



**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9840

**Title:** PCOS as an independent risk factor for NAFLD: a review of the pathogenesis, diagnosis, and management

**Reviewer code:** 00037028

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-01 19:15

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-07 06:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is an interesting and comprehensive review of the association of NAFLD and PCOS. Other than being a little lengthy, I find no major faults with the manuscript. Some of the citations do not list all authors per journal style.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9840

**Title:** PCOS as an independent risk factor for NAFLD: a review of the pathogenesis, diagnosis, and management

**Reviewer code:** 00184525

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-01 19:15

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-09 05:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is a detailed and up to date review examining the significance of polycystic ovary syndrome (PCOS) in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD). Major comments Page 6, 1st paragraph: The “two-hit” hypothesis for the pathogenesis of NAFLD is currently abandoned. “One-hit” or “multiple-hit” hypotheses should be presented here instead. Page 12-14: The section on screening should be reduced in length and stay in focus. There are several recent reviews on noninvasive imaging, scoring systems and serological tests to diagnose NAFLD/NASH and assess fibrosis that could replace the extensive description that is not required for a review on PCOS. In this way several of the too many references will be omitted. Pages 16-21: The section on management should also be reduced in length. Recent relevant reviews on NAFLD treatment can be used in place of the detailed information for every type of therapeutic approach followed by data related to PCOS. Minor comments Introduction, page 2, lines 3-4: Additional causes for hepatic steatosis should be mentioned here such as hepatitis C virus infection and nutritional disorders. Several acronyms should be explained the first time they appear in the text i.e. IR, SHBG, TNF etc