

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7722

**Title:** Laparoscopic Gastro-intestinal Metabolic Surgery for the Treatment of Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus

**Reviewer code:** 02494120

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2013-12-05 10:11

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-03 23:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review on bariatric surgery as metabolic surgery for the control of type 2 diabetes. I have only some concern on the title why using laparoscopic GI metabolic surgery if the paper reviewed are not all laparoscopic procedures. In the review they discuss of the role of surgery in general and not specifically of laparoscopic. I understand that nowadays most of the procedures are done laparoscopically but I don't think that the main goal of the paper is to discuss of the laparoscopic technique itself but of the role of bariatric surgery in general to halt the metabolic devastating effects of type II diabetes. In the key words, abstract and core aim the Authors never use the term laparoscopic but they always use terms such as metabolic surgery, GI surgery, bariatric surgery. I suggest to change the title with: "Gastrointestinal Metabolic Surgery for the treatment of type 2 Diabetes Mellitus"

**ESPS Peer-review Report****Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7722**Title:** Laparoscopic Gastro-intestinal Metabolic Surgery for the Treatment of Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus**Reviewer code:** 00506294**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou**Date sent for review:** 2013-12-05 10:11**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-10 19:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The review entitled: "Laparoscopic Gastro-intestinal Metabolic Surgery for the Treatment of Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus", is a good review about this item, well written and the authors treated all the matters about this controversial technique. They review the selection of patients and specific criteria, the mechanisms involved in glycemic control after gastrointestinal surgery as the incretin effect as consequence of hormonal changes responsible of the improvement of insulin secretion. They also review the procedures and compare the effectiveness of bariatric procedures and medical management of type 2 diabetes mellitus; the indications and the glycemic control in the different situations. They selected also the appropriate references about this technique.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7722

**Title:** Laparoscopic Gastro-intestinal Metabolic Surgery for the Treatment of Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus

**Reviewer code:** 00503542

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2013-12-05 10:11

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-12 13:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This review article summarizes recent findings about bariatric surgery and discusses them from many aspects especially from pathophysiological aspect of T2DM and gut hormones. The content of this article seems proper and interesting. However, some problems can be pointed out as follows. 1. The abstract seems like introduction. Please include important findings and some conclusive statements. 2. Abbreviations such as RYGB, LSG DJB-SG, TGR5 and IDF need to be spelled out at their first appearance. From this point, types of metabolic surgery may be mentioned in an earlier part of the manuscript. 3. English can be improved. And more careful proofreading is needed. The style of the references is not consistent (use of capital letters, etc.). What is "Ileal transposition (II)"?

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7722

**Title:** Laparoscopic Gastro-intestinal Metabolic Surgery for the Treatment of Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus

**Reviewer code:** 00722715

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2013-12-05 10:11

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-14 19:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the complete and well classified review on metabolic surgery. It was better to provide the method of literature review and searching criteria.