



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10140

Title: Robotic Surgery for Rectal Cancer: Current Immediate Clinical and Oncological Outcomes.

Reviewer code: 00058121

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-03-15 17:44

Date reviewed: 2014-04-26 13:39

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I congratulate authors for their considerable effort to meet the demands of such a huge systematic review. In my opinion the present study has the following serious drawback: Every single outcome in this study is given in a mean value and a range. This can only be extracted if authors have had individual data of included patients in the studies. Moreover, authors do not provide their methodology to get these numbers. The following two suggestions are at the discretion of the authors to apply: Importance of this manuscript and the significance on clinical research has to be proved since the provided information has already been published in two meta-analysis: [Ann Surg Oncol. 2012 Jul;19(7):2095-101, Colorectal Dis. 2012 Apr;14(4):e134-56]. Authors have included 14 comparative studies, six more than the aforementioned studies and this kind of data must be analyzed in a formal statistical way in order to give strong evidence. Included case series can be analyzed by proportion meta-analysis: This function enables to calculate an overall proportion from a set of proportions.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10140

Title: Robotic Surgery for Rectal Cancer: Current Immediate Clinical and Oncological Outcomes.

Reviewer code: 00040631

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-03-15 17:44

Date reviewed: 2014-05-02 17:20

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

dear Editor I reviewed the manuscript 10140 and i think that it is interesting, well written and adequately updated, therefore it may be published as it is best regards Mario Pescatori md frcs ebsq