



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5489

Title: The combination of chemotherapy and DC-CIK immunotherapy on colon cancer: a meta-analysis.

Reviewer code: 01166697

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-12 17:00

Date reviewed: 2013-09-23 17:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript the authors investigated whether autologous DC-CIK therapy is able to improve the therapeutic efficacy of chemotherapy in colon cancer. The authors conducted a systematic review of published papers from several different sources. They found that the combination of the DC-CIK immunotherapy and chemotherapy demonstrates a superiority in prolonging the survival time and enhancing immunological responses. In recent years there has been great interest in cancer immunotherapy, which has the potential of controlling metastatic disease, prolonging time to recurrence, and ultimately serving as a preventive measure. The study is well performed and the manuscript is clear and convincing. Minor point: The introduction could be shortened and/or moved to the Discussion section.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5489

Title: The combination of chemotherapy and DC-CIK immunotherapy on colon cancer: a meta-analysis.

Reviewer code: 02571990

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-12 17:00

Date reviewed: 2013-09-24 15:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Introduction: you mentioned recognize CSCs in colon cancer, but you not specify which markers are used to identify them. You based the study in seven trials, and only are comparable the six where they used both DC and CLK.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5489

Title: The combination of chemotherapy and DC-CIK immunotherapy on colon cancer: a meta-analysis.

Reviewer code: 02571962

Science editor: Wang, Jin-Lei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-12 17:00

Date reviewed: 2013-09-30 17:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Several comments regarding to the manuscript entitled “The combination of chemotherapy and DC-CIK immunotherapy on colon cancer: a meta-analysis” are listed below: 1. Although the authors claim that this is the first study to evaluate the survival and the effect of the treatment by the extraction and meta-analysis of the pooled data in colon cancer, the summarized data from these trials are all from China. Since different race may contribute to the differential responses in cancer treatment, the authors should modify the article title to reflect the geological area of their statistical summary. 2. The conclusion from this manuscript is based on the summaries of other published studies. As the studies with “positive association” normally tend to be published easier than the other ones, analysis of the published results from other studies may contribute the bias to the summary. 3. Randomization is one of the critical point in statistical analysis. Although those published studies should be the randomized trials, selection process for the suitable trials to be included for statistical analysis in this manuscript may not be randomized. 4. The authors stated in the manuscript (p.8) that some of the clinical information from the trials, such as tumor diameter, performance status, and age were not analyzed due to insufficient data. However, the tumor status, tumor size and patient age are important factors involving in patient survival. Without adjusting these parameters, the conclusion drawn from this manuscript may not be adequate. Also, the authors did not state in the abstract nor in the conclusion that these parameters, such as tumor status, tumor size and patient age, were not adjusted in the statistical summaries they made. 5. Although 7 trials were narrowed down for statistical analysis, the summarized results present in this manuscript for disease-free survival were only from 2 trials. Due to the small population size (94-163 patients), the



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

conclusion the authors made may not be adequate. 6. There are several grammatical errors and typos (ex. P.9 “chemontherapy” should be “chemotherapy”; “showsed” should be “showed”; “sumarrized” should be “summarized”, “andequte” should be “adequate”, Fig.1 “36 vitro experiment” should be “36 in vitro experiments”,.....) throughout this manuscript, and some sentences need to be rewritten. The authors should be more careful on the language editing, and English editing is needed for this manuscript.