

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 5957

Title: The History and Present Status of Pulmonary Metastasectomy in Colorectal Cancer ID 01076835

Reviewer code: 00073640

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-10-04 16:17

Date reviewed: 2013-10-19 16:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript Number: 5957 Title: The History and Present Status of Pulmonary Metastasectomy in Colorectal Cancer ID 01076835 COMMENTS: This is a well written and very interesting paper with very high level of scientific validity from different point of views. From this paper it can be clearly seen that the authors are true experts on their fields and that they have broad knowledge and also high ethic and moral values. I have only few minor comments/suggestion to improve the quality of this contribution: - The introduction section It is very well written but I would include information about colorectal cancer statistics (both incidence and mortality) as well as few sentences that CRC can be cured if diagnosed at earlier stages. But in spite of that fact, there are still 600,000 deaths... Colorectal cancer (CRC) is one of the most commonly diagnosed cancers worldwide, with over 1.2 million new cases being recorded in 2008. There are different approaches and strategies concerning how to reduce the incidence of and mortality due to CRC. Those directed toward the treatment of CRC, i.e., surgical and therapeutic measures, are mostly costly, painful and the prognosis is not promising. Efforts have also recently been directed toward the identification and removal of precancerous lesions (visible polypoid adenomas) through screening programs, which is a promising approach and is an important step in reducing mortality due to CRC. - There are unanswered questions in the paper located in line 155/156 and 201/202 and 291/292 I would sincerely suggest to reform these questions into appropriate form for instance " we found no data



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

whether they lived longer or better as result ..." or "Since we found no data about ..." - There is no conclusion At the end of the paper I would expect few sentences that summarize authors' the most important take home message

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 5957

Title: The History and Present Status of Pulmonary Metastasectomy in Colorectal Cancer ID 01076835

Reviewer code: 02438485

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-10-04 16:17

Date reviewed: 2013-12-02 10:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting paper with special aspect. Unfortunately, however, style and focusing topics are not so good. Major comments 1. What is news in this paper? Please clarify the news focusing on the current topics of diagnosis and treatment. 2. What is aim in this paper? Please be more specific including backgrounds in the previous reports. Minor comment: Author should prepare for table and/or figure to make clear topics. It will be helpful for many readers to understand it well.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 5957

Title: The History and Present Status of Pulmonary Metastasectomy in Colorectal Cancer ID 01076835

Reviewer code: 02861191

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2013-10-04 16:17

Date reviewed: 2014-07-17 22:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review highlighting the important questions in the field and also the limitations associated with resections of especially lung metastases in crc. I would just reconmmend to introduce a paragraph highlighting how metatastectomy ca be used in multimodal conceps including chemotherapy, ... would be helpful. Finally. the decision whether the article is suitable for the WJG or rather for a journal more focused on history of medicine has to be taken by the editor.