

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5674

Title: Immunogenetics biomarkers in inflammatory bowel disease: Role of the IBD3 region

Reviewer code: 02530264

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-24 09:46

Date reviewed: 2013-11-12 01:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a comprehensive article that gathers information about the importance of IBD3 genomic region in susceptibility to inflammatory bowel disease. Although it presents a good literature revision it shows some problems that will be described below.

1. General comments: - A number of language inaccuracies was found; - Some text paragraphs are almost an exact copy from articles cited; - There are also some inconsistent, unclear observations.

2. Detailed list of problems found

a) Language inaccuracies: - page 4, line 2: "now" should probably be replaced by "from now on" - Page 4, line 3: "... are defective only in CD; the autophagy genes ATG16L1 and IRGM." It seems that a word is missing. - page 5, 2nd last line: "... while positive association of CD pathology was associated with..." should be replaced by "... while positive association of CD pathology was found with..." - page 6, line 10: "... was not associated in our study." should be replaced by "... was not associated to CD in our study." - page 12, line 5: "... activating NK cells with promoted NKG2D and IFN- γ production" should be replaced by "... activating NK cells with enhanced NKG2D and IFN- γ production" - page 14, line 9: "...genetics..." should be replaced by "...genetic..." - page 14, line 13 and others: the symbol after TNF was not clear. Could it possibly be a formatting problem? - page 15, line 4: "... (308G/A SNP)..." should be replaced by "... (-308G/A SNP)..." - page 15, line 11: "... inhibited..." should possibly be replaced by "...inhibitory..." - page 15, line 27: "... polymorphism..." should be replaced by "...polymorphisms..." - page 17, line 3: "... anti-TNF- α agents' mechanisms of action ..." should be replaced by "...the mechanisms of action of anti-TNF α agents..." - page 17, line 25: "... immunogenetics" should be replaced by "...immunogenetic..."

b) Sentences almost exact copies from articles cited: - page 7, paragraph 4: This paragraph is almost an exact copy from abstract of reference



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

18. Besides, the 14bp deletion polymorphism should be referred to as Del- or Del+, not Del1 or Del2 - page 8, paragraph 2: " These contradictory data..." which data are contradictory? In my opinion, the following observations are possible explanations for the importance of HLA region for IBD susceptibility and do not explain contradictory data. This paragraph is almost an exact copy of reference 1, page 3629. - page 13, paragraph 1: This paragraph is almost an exact copy from abstract of reference 54. c) Unclear or inconsistent observations: - page 7, paragraph 2: I believe that references are reversed. Where is "(43)" should be "(44)", and also the opposite. Besides, the studies cited are contradictory, not confirmatory. The Chinese study (44) found a positive association with CD but the Japanese study found a negative association. Can the authors give a possible explanation for this? - page 12, paragraph 5, lines 1-4: There seems to be a redundancy. The authors should refer that it was already stated above. - page 13, paragraph 2, lines 1-3: " Likewise, we have recently found a higher frequency of MICA-129met/met and a lower frequency of MICA-129val/met genotypes in IBD...". These findings seem contradictory to what Zhao described (ref. 54)... Not likewise?



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5674

Title: Immunogenetics biomarkers in inflammatory bowel disease: Role of the IBD3 region

Reviewer code: 00004594

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-24 09:46

Date reviewed: 2013-11-25 12:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper of Manuel Moro et al. is a good review of immunogenetics in IBD. The paper is easy to read and actualized. The chapter on TNF is very important because of its therapeutic implication. I have only minor comments: - remove s from immunogenetics in the title - same for the running title I would use the plural for inflammatory bowel diseases in the title and in the introduction (Inflammatory bowel diseases (IBD) are....)