



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10281

**Title:** Current Status of Laparoscopy for the Treatment of Rectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 02823705

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-24 13:10

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-25 07:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent review, but needs some revisions: 1. despite this is a review, in the section TECHNIQUE you end up with 2 paragraphs of results, not clearly referred to any series presented here, at least not till now... "Analysis of the short term outcome after this way of performing laparoscopic proctectomy shows a mean operative time of 245 minutes and a mean hospital stay of 7 days [10]. In our experience we had a significantly lower rate of 30 day postoperative morbidity compared to open surgery as well as a high patient satisfaction from the cosmetic outcome [Figures 3-4]. Different nuances in the technique of laparoscopic proctetomy have been described. One example in a single stapled technique for low anterior resection, in which an intracorporeal purse-string suture is placed on the distal rectum and the specimen is extracted trans-anally [11]. " Please delete this or describe what these data are referring to

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10281

**Title:** Current Status of Laparoscopy for the Treatment of Rectal Cancer

**Reviewer code:** 01587889

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-24 13:10

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-03 00:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] No records	

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article discusses the current available knowledge about the use of the laparoscopic approach for rectal cancer, describing the technique for laparoscopic proctectomy and assessed the current literature that was mostly studies over the past two decades dealing with the outcomes and the oncologic safety of laparoscopic vs. robotic assisted surgery and laparotomy. They have beautifully evaluated the evolving issues of rectal cancer surgery and the current innovations in this field. I find the review well summarized and the references are reasonable. Most interestingly, the authors discuss and compare the advantages and challenges of these available techniques and the postoperative outcome. Further, they describe the technical maneuver and feasibility of performing RPC and IPAA to construct a reservoir with a J-pouch. The authors' finalized by cautioning that despite the fact that these approaches are promising should currently be used in the context of clinical trials until there will be evidence for their safety, feasibility and at least non-inferiority related to the standard laparoscopic approach. This is a good review.