

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9075

Title: Effect of spleen operation on antiviral treatment in HCV-related cirrhotic patients

Reviewer code: 00978228

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-01-19 16:22

Date reviewed: 2014-01-20 06:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Since it has been reported that leukocytes, especially monocytes/macrophages are the major target of HCV infection (CVD Prevention and Control 2010;5:51-58), the authors should review and discuss about this issue.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9075

Title: Effect of spleen operation on antiviral treatment in HCV-related cirrhotic patients

Reviewer code: 00159305

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-01-19 16:22

Date reviewed: 2014-01-28 03:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To the authors, Your manuscript is an interesting systematic review on the impact of spleen operation on antiviral therapy in HCV-related cirrhotic patients. However, I have some concerns listed below, and corrections should be made before the manuscript can be accepted for publication.

General comments Throughout the text (including part of legends Fig 4 and 5) there are many grammatical errors that must be corrected. Perhaps, you should seek a copyediting service provided by professional English language editing company.

Abstract You should follow the instructions to the authors: 1. First paragraph should be rewritten 2. Methods: it is OK. 3. Results: should be re-written as there is confusion in the way the results are presented. 4. Conclusions: last phrase is confusing and should be rewritten. Core tip- last paragraph, please, re-written it clearer.

Introduction-paragraph regarding DAA, should be re-written ;also, please, indicate references.

Materials and Methods Literature retrieval: second line, please, correct "literature" instead of "literatures"

Results Characteristics of included studies -paragraph 1, line 5: please, change the word "perform" with "undergo"!, otherwise the reader will understand that patients (not the surgeons) performed the operation. -paragraph 2, line 3: please, indicate how many patients with genotype 1 were treated 48 weeks; the same observation for those with genotype 2/3 for 24 weeks HCC: Last phrase: please indicate references. Discussion -page 10, 2nd paragraph, 1st phrase: please indicate references 2nd phrase: please correct grammatical errors (e.g. Moreover, etc) 3rd phrase Ref 31: it is hard to believe that all cirrhotic patients with thrombocytopenia undergo splenectomy or PSE before IFN treatment in 2014! (Guidelines cited refers to 2008?) 5th phrase-it is confused (Ref 16 is not in right place) and should be re-written -page 10, 3rd paragraph: first line: "in his" instead of "in



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

the.." Several grammatical errors (e.g. spenectomy, literatures), please, correct Last phrase should be re-written Page 11: there are several grammatical errors (e.g. recentaly) please, correct 1st paragraph: please, see again the work of Ikeda et al: discontinuation or SVR occurred in 22%..and 28%? Last paragraph, 2nd phrase should be re-written and please, change "is yet suspicious"! Page 12: same observations for English language -2nd paragraph .last phrase (.."several conclusions can be drawn.." but you did not mentioned them! Conclusion is a separate section. Please, re-write the last paragraph from discussion

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9075

Title: Effect of spleen operation on antiviral treatment in HCV-related cirrhotic patients

Reviewer code: 02528284

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-01-19 16:22

Date reviewed: 2014-02-19 19:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments: Dr Bo Feng and collaborators demonstrated that spleen operation combined with IFN α -based antiviral therapy can be suitable to HCV cirrhotic patients with genotypes 2/3 other than those with genotype 1. The manuscript deals with a difficult subject and not well documented. The purpose of the study is not enough supported. The data based on the small number of findings from other investigators are not strong enough to robustly support the statement proposed. Overall the paper needs a careful reassessment of the statements proposed by the authors. Comments Abstract: ...literatures were systematically ... must be literature Abstract: ... related clinical studies...must be related to clinical studies Abstract:..... Of 372 patients .. must be From 373... Abstract:...controlled studies must be control studies Core tip: Hematology abnormalities ... must be Hematological abnormalities In all sections the paper needs language editing.