

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7179

Title: Fish consumption and risk of gastrointestinal cancers: a meta-analysis of cohort studies

Reviewer code: 02536020

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-08 17:01

Date reviewed: 2013-11-20 02:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article describes the associations between fish consumption and cancers of the gastrointestinal tract. Authors performed a meta analysis and an inverse relationship was detected between fish consumption and cancers.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7179

Title: Fish consumption and risk of gastrointestinal cancers: a meta-analysis of cohort studies

Reviewer code: 00051227

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-08 17:01

Date reviewed: 2014-01-25 19:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review presents a meta-analysis of prospective cohort studies on association between fish consumption and the risk of gastrointestinal cancers. The authors conclude that fish intake may reduce gastrointestinal cancer incidence. This is interesting and well written review, on an important topic. The data presented confirm and significantly extend the data already published.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7179

Title: Fish consumption and risk of gastrointestinal cancers: a meta-analysis of cohort studies

Reviewer code: 00227589

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-08 17:01

Date reviewed: 2014-02-11 13:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript submitted by Yu et al. discusses the consumption of fish in relationship to the relative risk of gastrointestinal cancers through a meta-analysis of published human studies. Overall the paper is very well written and addresses an important relationship between diet and GI cancers. Based on the presented data it appears that there is significant heterogeneity among the studies which weakens the outcome that the authors report. This is a limitation of the current analysis which should be addressed in future studies that evaluate nutrition and correlate it with chronic disorders. The authors did not consider other variables that may influence the risk of developing GI cancers - such as smoking, environmental factors, other dietary habits, etc. This is a limitation of the study although the reader can appreciate the attempt of reviewing the currently available information on the topic. I recommend publication of the study after careful consideration of the discussion section that should stimulate and encourage further research and scientific investigation into the relationship between fish consumption and GI cancer risk.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7179

Title: Fish consumption and risk of gastrointestinal cancers: a meta-analysis of cohort studies

Reviewer code: 00058198

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-08 17:01

Date reviewed: 2014-02-13 04:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors Thank you for this nice presentation

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7179

Title: Fish consumption and risk of gastrointestinal cancers: a meta-analysis of cohort studies

Reviewer code: 00009357

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-08 17:01

Date reviewed: 2014-03-07 00:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors performed a meta-analysis to determine the risk of cancer associated with fish consumption. The obtained data revealed that fish consumption may reduce gastrointestinal cancer incidence. The manuscript is interesting however several points should be addressed prior publication. These include a revision in English language and the figures 2 and 6 need more clarification.