

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9942

**Title:** Benign Giant Cell Tumor of the common bile duct: one case report and a review of the literature

**Reviewer code:** 00013310

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-06 08:41

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-17 20:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The authors reported a case of giant cell tumor of the common bile duct, which seems to be very rare. Although the summary of the manuscript emphasizes the differentiation between some type of anaplastic carcinoma with giant cells and primary giant cell tumor, there were very few statement concerning the anaplastic or undifferentiated carcinoma with giant cells in the discussion. Therefore, the summary is out of focus or the discussion is insufficient.. There was no description of the operative procedure for this tumor. Usually, the tumor of the CBD is resected with pancreas head (pancreatoduodenectomy). The author should describe the operative procedure for this case.

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9942

**Title:** Benign Giant Cell Tumor of the common bile duct: one case report and a review of the literature

**Reviewer code:** 02731854

**Science editor:** Su-Xin Gou

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-06 08:41

**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-22 15:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

**General comments** The authors reported a case of benign giant cell tumor of the common bile duct. Overall, the manuscript is a nicely done and well thought out paper. **Specific Comments Summary** Please note the patient age and sex. **Case Report** Please use an abbreviation "CT" for the sentence: "A computed tomography scan of the abdomen revealed a dilated common bile duct, with a 1.2-cm mass projecting into the lumen of the middle common bile duct, causing almost complete obstruction (Fig. 1)." **Discussion** Please correct the word "[7Albores-Saavedra]" into "[7]" in the following sentence: "Anaplastic spindle and giant cell carcinoma with osteoclast-like giant cells of the bile duct can also show numerous giant cells that may simulate giant cell tumors[7Albores-Saavedra]." **Figure and Table** For figure 1, please show the lesion more clearly by enlarging CT figures. For figure legend of figure 3, please correct the word "Ck19" into "CK19" and unify the size of the characters. Please include this reported case in Table 1. . For Table 1, please spell out or show explanatory notes for abbreviations including CBD, CT, and ERCP. **References:** Adequate selection