

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10351

Title: Increasing Expression and Possible Role of Chitinase 3-like-1 in Colitis-Associated Carcinoma Model

Reviewer code: 00050232

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-03-31 15:06

Date reviewed: 2014-04-07 23:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The work shows for the first time the association of increased expression of chitinase 3 like 1 in an experimental model of colorectal cancer. It also shows a temporal and spatial (more distal) relationship with the intensification of the expression of a candidate marker, underscoring its possible potential to indicate malignancy. However, it does not present any concrete evidence of the role of oxidative stress in marker expression through the effect of caffeine. It deserves publishing as a result of the first two points highlighted.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10351

Title: Increasing Expression and Possible Role of Chitinase 3-like-1 in Colitis-Associated Carcinoma Model

Reviewer code: 00227449

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-03-31 15:06

Date reviewed: 2014-04-30 21:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There are major problems in the experimental design and the dose of caffeine. The title of the manuscript "Increasing Expression and Possible Role of Chitinase 3-like-1 in Colitis-Associated Carcinoma Model", while accurately described the observation, also indicated that the manuscript had no new findings. CHI3L1 up-regulation during inflammation is known. The author hypothesized that CHI3L1 is a promoter or initiator of oncogenic transformation but the measurement on both models was on oxidative stress. CHI3L1 expression change and oxidative stress change could both be related to the severity of the inflammation and may not have any causal relationship. The function of CHI3L1 also does not support a causal relationship. In addition, the dose of caffeine was very high and would be equivalent to around 10 cups of coffee per day in human. The pharmacology effect of caffeine could be due to factors independent of inflammation.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10351

Title: Increasing Expression and Possible Role of Chitinase 3-like-1 in Colitis-Associated Carcinoma Model

Reviewer code: 00034168

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2014-03-31 15:06

Date reviewed: 2014-05-07 16:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Three cycles of DSS was applied. How about the successful rate of colitis? How many mice can tolerate 3 cycles of treatment with 3% of DSS? 2. What is the future study plan about this CHI3L1 and its linkage with colorectal cancer? Any data from clinical patients? 3. What is the major contribution of HT29 cell line study?