

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9534

Title: Magnifying endoscopy of gastric epithelial dysplasia based on the morphologic characteristics

Reviewer code: 00036023

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-02-16 14:49

Date reviewed: 2014-04-27 01:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting descriptive paper on use of magnifying endoscopy of gastric epithelial dysplasia based on the morphologic characteristics. As such there is little to criticize and overall quality of the paper is good.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9534

Title: Magnifying endoscopy of gastric epithelial dysplasia based on the morphologic characteristics

Reviewer code: 00183658

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-02-16 14:49

Date reviewed: 2014-04-27 23:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article from South Korea is aim to investigate the difference in magnifying endoscopic findings of gastric epithelial dysplasias according to the morphologic characteristics, and to analyze the association between ME-NBI findings and the mucin expression pattern. The title is "Magnifying endoscopy of gastric epithelial dysplasia based on the morphologic characteristics". 1. This is a retrospective study. Some limitations might be occurred. 2. This endoscopic procedure needed the experienced endoscopists and the facility of the hospital. 3. The clinical application of the study is very important. The authors should to be recommended the readers to apply this knowledge into routine clinical practice.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9534

Title: Magnifying endoscopy of gastric epithelial dysplasia based on the morphologic characteristics

Reviewer code: 00503748

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-02-16 14:49

Date reviewed: 2014-05-05 11:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title of the manuscript under review: "Magnifying endoscopy of gastric epithelial dysplasia based on the morphologic characteristics" **GENERAL COMMENTS** This is a very interesting manuscript that describes gastric epithelial dysplasias (GEDs) characteristics examined under magnifying endoscopy (ME) using narrow band imaging(NBI) and also investigated the association between mucin expression markers and ME-NBI findings. This manuscript meets all the criteria of (1) importance of the research and the significance of the research contents, (2) novelty and innovation of the research, (3) presentation and readability of the manuscript, as well as, ethics of the research. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS** Minor Comments 1. Section "Magnifying endoscopy using narrow band imaging": Authors could add the technique that they used in order to estimate the percentage of the displastic area that the positive futures were present. 2. Authors could add a section regarding the endoscopic resection technique used. 3. Statistical analysis / Results: Is the use of ANOVA, as a parametric test, the best option for this sample size? 4. Table 3: The title of the table should mention that the findings refer to the MS patterns. 5. Table 4: The title of the table should mention that the findings refer to the MV patterns. **CLASSIFICATION OF THE MANUSCRIPT:** A **LANGUAGE EVALUATION:** A

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9534

Title: Magnifying endoscopy of gastric epithelial dysplasia based on the morphologic characteristics

Reviewer code: 00289451

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-02-16 14:49

Date reviewed: 2014-05-11 01:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript aimed to investigate by using magnifying endoscopy using narrow band imaging (ME-NBI) before endoscopic resection the difference between adenomatous and foveolar GEDs, and to analyze the association between ME-NBI findings and the mucin expression pattern. The paper is well written and I have only minor comments to be addressed. Comment 1: an additional figure reporting the case of hybrid category would be interesting for the reader as done for Figure 1 and 2. Comment 2: an automatic approach (clustering, etc.) should be considered for future quantitative examinations going beyond qualitative observations. Several image segmentation approaches are available in literature and the following should be cited properly as future quantification need in the conclusion section. REFERENCE TO BE ADDED: ? Riaz F, Silva FB, Ribeiro MD, Coimbra MT. Impact of visual features on the segmentation of gastroenterology images using normalized cuts.IEEE Trans Biomed Eng. 2013 May;60(5):1191-201. doi: 10.1109/TBME.2012.2230174 ? Massoptier L, Casciaro S. A new fully automatic and robust algorithm for fast segmentation of liver tissue and tumors from CT scans. Eur Radiol. 2008 Aug;18(8):1658-65. doi: 10.1007/s00330-008-0924-y.