

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9852

Title: Enteral Nutrition and Immune Modulation of Acute Pancreatitis

Reviewer code: 02927089

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-03-01 20:15

Date reviewed: 2014-04-20 13:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In their review "Enteral Nutrition and Immune Modulation of Acute Pancreatitis" Hegazi and Dewitt focus on the role of nutrition on the course of severe acute pancreatitis. The author gives an introduction on the main problem and then discusses the pros and contras of enteral and parenteral nutrition in detail. The article shows the expert knowledge of the author in this field and is interesting for surgeons and clinicians treating patients with acute pancreatitis. We can recommend this article for publication in Worl J Gastroenterology.

However, there are several minor points that need to be addressed:

- 1.) Is there a conflict of interest?
- 2.) page 3, reference 1 seems quite old. Is there a more recent publication on this ?
- 3.) Please explain abbreviations (for exapample "PN")
- 4.) "Immune Modulating Effects of Pre and Probiotics" - I would not use abbreviations in heading
- 5.) Page 7, "Prebiotics have been previously reported to be beneficial to the care of SAP patients in helping normalized APACHE II and CRP levels" -> helping to normalize?
- 6.) Page 7, " However, the study by Bessilink et al (2008) casted some doubt on the beneficial role of probiotics. However, this study has some limitations that we previously discussed in detail." ->Readers might not have access to the mentioned publications. I would advise to metioned the limitations.
- 7.) Page 7, "Sharma et al. looked at the role of probiotics on gut permeability and endotoxemia to prevent infectious complications in AP patients [20]. Interestingly, the investigators enrolled 50



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com <http://www.wjgnet.com>

patients into a double-blind, randomized placebo controlled trial prior to abandoning the study due to excessive mortality and infections in SAP patients reported by Besselink et al." -> was mortality high in the study of Sharma or in the study of Besselink? This can be misunderstood.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9852

Title: Enteral Nutrition and Immune Modulation of Acute Pancreatitis

Reviewer code: 02510721

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-03-01 20:15

Date reviewed: 2014-04-22 16:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The abstract shows a well-correct plan of development of the review of early enteral nutrition with tube feeding in the acute pancreatitis. In the section is clearly declared the aim very practical of this study: correct position of tube-feeding and proper selection of the feeding formula. "Introduction" Appropriate presentation of the need of enteral nutrition in severe acute pancreatitis. "Immune modulating effects of enteral nutrition" The pathophysiologic sequence of SAP from local inflammatory process to SIRS is well presented but i think not correct to overlap the SAP with SIRS because the enteral nutrition at the beginning of severe or also moderate/severe forms of pancreatitis when the systemic inflammatory response can not be started. "Early versus delayed..." In this section the study proves that the choice of early enteral nutrition allows better clinical outcomes. "Immune modulating effects of Pre and Probiotics." In this section there is a review of some studies, collected without structured criterion, therefore the conclusion is debatable. Conclusion is in line with the aim of the study. References are uptodated. "To Author" The study offers the possibility of agreeable reading with no structured review of the literature about a very complex item. Therefore it is far from a scientific presentation.