

**ESPS Peer-review Report****Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10305**Title:** Mitochondrial DNA alterations in the progression of distal gastric carcinomas: unexplored issues and future research needs.**Reviewer code:** 01550345**Science editor:** Yuan Qi**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-26 20:49**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-13 23:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The manuscript is very long, very difficult to read to any not involved in the specific field, full of jargon. For example : - the introduction is not focused on the topic, it is very general - classification of gastritis is similarly very general - the core starts with the classification of Adenocarcinomas, to which the previous paragraphs could be attached and simplified - the two tables are poorly related to the text - the re-classification would benefit of a proper simple table - the whole manuscript should be simplified for the average reader of WJG.

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10305

**Title:** Mitochondrial DNA alterations in the progression of distal gastric carcinomas: unexplored issues and future research needs.

**Reviewer code:** 00537853

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-26 20:49

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-16 22:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article summarizes the mitochondrial DNA mutations in gastric carcinomas and their precancerous conditions, suggesting future research about the role of these alterations in gastric carcinogenesis. The manuscript is well written and complete. I suggest to extend the section and references about the different clinical outcome of Lauren intestinal and diffuse types.

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10305

**Title:** Mitochondrial DNA alterations in the progression of distal gastric carcinomas: unexplored issues and future research needs.

**Reviewer code:** 01168670

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-26 20:49

**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-21 23:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article by Rigoli and Caruso, "Mitochondrial DNA alterations in the progression of distal gastric carcinomas: unexplored issues and future research needs" is well written and seeks to summarize and review the niche of mitochondrial DNA alterations in the progression of gastric cancer. Insights into the underlying pathophysiology of gastric cancer are timely and evaluation of the role of mtDNA is a novel concept. This review seems to encompass all of the major background with respect to what is known about gastric cancer and its histologic subtypes and current classification. Data is provided about the incidence of mtDNA mutations, particularly at early stages of cancer development and implications are thus made about the role of these mutations toward progression. Minor suggestions (though not required) might be to include brief discussion of any translational studies to evaluate the functional significance of mtDNA mutations with respect to laboratory experiments on gastric epithelial cells either in vitro or in animal models? Is there any information based upon sequencing of such mtDNA mutations in gastric CA to suggest functional effects of these gene products?