



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9231

Title: Insulin-like Growth Factor-1 Receptor Overexpression is Associated With Poor Response of Rectal cancers to Preoperative Radiotherapy

Reviewer code: 00042073

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-02-08 09:52

Date reviewed: 2014-02-12 01:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

none



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9231

Title: Insulin-like Growth Factor-1 Receptor Overexpression is Associated With Poor Response of Rectal cancers to Preoperative Radiotherapy

Reviewer code: 00045997

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-02-08 09:52

Date reviewed: 2014-02-13 07:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Wu and colleagues investigated the relationship between insulin-like growth factor-1 expression and preoperative response of radiotherapy in rectal cancers. They showed IGF-1R overexpression was significantly correlated with a poor response to radiotherapy, from the results of IHC and RT-PCR. Although the results look informative to the gastroenterologists, a number of points need clarifying and certain statements require further justification. These are given below. Major 1. How many samples were taken before the radiotherapy? Authors are encouraged to show if there is heterogeneity of IGF-1R expression in rectal cancer. 2. In Discussion, authors described that ‘all 1 subjects with negative IGF-1R expression showed good response to radiotherapy (8 cases of RCRG1 and 3 cases of RCRG2)’, which seems inconsistent with the Table 2. 3. As authors addressed, there could be an up-regulation of IGF-1R protein in remaining cancer cells. However, considering heterogeneity of IGF-1R, there also could be another aspect; IGF-1R expressing cells did not respond to the radiotherapy resulting in that residual tumor cells showed high expression of IGF-1R. Minor 1. What is the difference in role between these two pictures in Fig.3? Are both figures necessary? 2. Ref 10 does not seem to meet the instruction. Please make sure.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9231

Title: Insulin-like Growth Factor-1 Receptor Overexpression is Associated With Poor Response of Rectal cancers to Preoperative Radiotherapy

Reviewer code: 00036825

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-02-08 09:52

Date reviewed: 2014-03-02 19:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the Table 2 it is required to involve cTNM stages to make the results more clear for the clinical practice.