



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10641

Title: A case of severe eosinophilic gastroenteritis: unusual clinical features and treatment with fecal microbiota transplantation and prednisone

Reviewer code: 02445687

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-11 12:16

Date reviewed: 2014-05-05 10:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Eosinophilic gastroenteritis is a refractory disease. The authors in the present manuscript report a case of eosinophilic gastroenteritis treated by fecal microbiota transplantation and prednisone. However, the treatment has not been approved by any Clinical Ethics Committee although the authors claim a on-going clinical trial (NCT01793831)for treating refractory Crohn's disease by fecal microbiota transplantation. Additionally, the authors should describe how to exclude the possibilities of malignancy, parasitic disease, and autoimmune disease.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10641

Title: A case of severe eosinophilic gastroenteritis: unusual clinical features and treatment with fecal microbiota transplantation and prednisone

Reviewer code: 02731212

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-11 12:16

Date reviewed: 2014-05-05 21:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report describes a 35 year-old man with severe eosinophilic gastroenteritis (originally mis-diagnosed as Crohn's) who is treated with FMT and then steroids and recovers completely. To my knowledge, there are no previous reports of eosinophilic gastroenteritis treated with FMT. The success of FMT in this case suggests that eosinophilic gastroenteritis--and perhaps other eosinophilic GI disorders such as EoE--is driven by the host-microbiome interaction and may be responsive to microbiome-based therapies. The authors should provide additional details regarding FMT. Was the patient pre-treated with antibiotics? Was the donor's stool tested for potential pathogens? Etc. Sequencing of the microbiome from stool or other specimens would have been extremely valuable. One assumes that the patient took on some of the microbiome characteristics of the donor, and sequencing could have identified taxa with the greatest changes.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10641

Title: A case of severe eosinophilic gastroenteritis: unusual clinical features and treatment with fecal microbiota transplantation and prednisone

Reviewer code: 00506590

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-11 12:16

Date reviewed: 2014-05-17 01:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This work describes an unusual case of severe eosinophilic gastroenteritis that was successfully treated by combination of prednisone and fecal microbiome transplant. The work is interesting and relevant for the pathology that in some cases is resistant to other treatments. It is intriguing the possibility that the patient may have been suffering of some infection. In this regard it is not mentioned if a microbiologic analysis was done. In particular it is important to evaluate infection by H. pylori due to a recent work in which the patient was cured from eosinophilic gastroenteritis just by eradicating the infection (Soavi, C. et al. 2014 Helicobacter 19(3):237-8). It will add strength to this work a discussion on how the FMT might be working.