



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10417

**Title:** Mechanistic links between gut microbial community dynamics, microbial functions and metabolic health

**Reviewer code:** 02907177

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-31 17:46

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-01 23:02

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION                                                  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION                                             |
|---------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing     | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection          |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                           | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            |                                                                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|                                                   |                                                                      | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |                                                        |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. For a basic purpose, the content is good 2. The diagnostic and therapeutic aspects related to the microbiota would be more useful 3. It is not a systematic review, limited to a narrative review 4. The evidence used to sustain the article is poor, with many studies in animal, "in vitro", about microbiology, physiology and pathology



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10417

**Title:** Mechanistic links between gut microbial community dynamics, microbial functions and metabolic health

**Reviewer code:** 02946383

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-31 17:46

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-06 02:55

| CLASSIFICATION                                         | LANGUAGE EVALUATION                                                   | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION                                             |
|--------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 |                                                                       | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|                                                        |                                                                       | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |                                                        |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is well written and providing an adequate updated overview of the gut microbiome study.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 10417

**Title:** Mechanistic links between gut microbial community dynamics, microbial functions and metabolic health

**Reviewer code:** 00072815

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-31 17:46

**Date reviewed:** 2014-05-30 19:19

| CLASSIFICATION                                         | LANGUAGE EVALUATION                                                  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION                                             |
|--------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing     | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 |                                                                      | BPG Search:                         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|                                                        |                                                                      | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |                                                        |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is an excellent overview of the gut microbiome study, which is a "hot" topic nowadays. I have two comments: 1. The association of the microbiome and the central nervous system should be mentioned (See Foster J A et al. Gut-brain axis... Trends to neurosciences 2013) 2. Though the function of Paneth cells is mentioned in Fig.2, but the role of beta defensins should be also discussed